

SEDUTA DEL 12 /12/2011

Presenti: Borghi, De Marchi, Forni, Fortuna, Milani, Ottobrini, Sgarbi, Soldani, Vai, Winsemann  
Presiede Milani.  
La seduta ha inizio alle ore 17.05.

COMUNICAZIONE:

**G. FORNI, *Might Hurro-Urartian and North-Caucasian Languages Be Derived from (or Related to) Indo-European?***

Several basic-lexicon etymologies, with regular sound correspondences, suggest Hurro-Urartian (HU) might be derived from (or related to) Proto-Indo-European (PIE). Preliminary evidence suggests North-Caucasian (NC) languages might also be related to PIE – in particular, to Iranian languages and Armenian.

*Introduction*

This short article summarizes the current status of a research project on the relationships between Hurro-Urartian (HU), North-Caucasian (NC) languages and Proto-Indo-European (PIE).

Previous research on HU and NC reached various conclusions, incl.:

- Hurrian (H) and Urartian (U) are related, but HU is an isolated family [Wilhelm 2008a and 2008b]
- HU and NC are related [Starostin, Nikolayev 1994]
- HU and NC belong to a wider phylum, Sino-Dené-Caucasian, which would also include Sino-Tibetan, Na-Dené, Yeniseyan, Basque and Burushaski, but not PIE (Starostin et al.)
- North-*West* Caucasian languages and PIE derive from a common ancestor, Proto-Pontic [Colarusso 1997]

This article suggests a simpler picture: both HU and NC might derive from PIE.

*Sources*

For H and U, [Wilhelm 2008a and 2008b] is the primary source; [Starostin, Nikolayev 1994] was also occasionally used as a secondary source.

(P)NC forms are from [Starostin, Nikolayev 1994].

PIE forms are from [Mallory, Adams 2006]; Iranian forms are from [Mallory, Adams 2006], [Cheung 2002] and [Bailey 1979]; Armenian forms are from [Martirosyan 2010].

Proto-Turkic forms are from [Starostin, Dybo, Mudrak 2003].

(Proto-)Kartvelian forms are from [Fährnich, Sardshweladse 1995] and [Klimov 1998].

## *Hurro-Urartian (HU)*

This section contains a selection of key findings from a wider, on-going research which started from a selection of 161 HU basic terms and morphemes and found likely or tentative PIE etymologies for 109 (=68%) of them, and no PIE etymology for 52 (=32%) of them.

A brief discussion of Hurrian sound system and PIE-to-Hurrian sound laws is followed by a selection of key likely etymologies for Hurrian basic vocabulary, with Urartian, IE and sometimes NC comparanda. A PIE-to-Urartian set of sound laws is not included in this article.

### *Hurrian sound system*

According to [Wilhelm 2008a: 84-85], “the distribution of voiced and voiceless consonants [...] is allophonic” i.e. “voicing is not phonemic” in Hurrian. Therefore, Hurrian spelling conventions can be turned into a phonemic representation as follows:

spelling (<...>)	phonemic representation (/.../)
<b, p>	/P/
<g, k>	/K/
<d, t>	/T/
<v, f>	/F/
<z, s>	/S/
<ž, š>	/Š/
<ğ, ħ>	/H/

Additionally, /F/ and /w/ are probably allophones as well [Wilhelm 2008a: 84, 85], and an alternation between /P/, /F, w/ and /m/ is also frequent [Wilhelm 2008a: 85, 87, 89, 90, 93, 97).

### *PIE-to-Hurrian sound laws*

Key sound laws identified so far include:

\*t, \*d, \*d<sup>h</sup> > /T/

\*k, \*g > /K/

\*p, \*b<sup>h</sup>(?) > /P/

\*t(i), dw(i), ĝ, ĝ<sup>h</sup> > /Š/

\*l > /l, r/ (compare Sanskrit)

\*V'CV > 'CV (loss of word-initial, pre-tonic vowels)

Evidence is still insufficient for sound laws concerning vowels and laryngeals. Other sound laws are mainly identities.

## HU – Key etymologies

1. H **iš**-te ‘I’ (*absolute*), **iž**-až ‘I’ (*ergative*), **šo**-, **šu**- ‘me’ (*obl.*) (/iš-, Šo-, Šu-); U **iš**-tidə ‘I’ (*absolute subject*), **iešə** ‘I’ (*ergative*), **šu**-kə ‘me’ (*absolute object*), **šu**-sə ‘my’ (prob. /i(e)s-, su-/) < PIE **\*h<sub>1</sub>eǵ(ó)**, i.e. /iš-/ < **\*h<sub>1</sub>eǵ**, /Šo-, Šu-/ < **\*h<sub>1</sub>eǵó**; compare Armenian **es**, Old Avestan **azəm**, Ossetic **æz**, Kurdish **ez**, Ormuri **az**, Yidgha **zo**, Sogdian ‘**zw**’, OCS **(j)azŭ**, and NC etymology #1 in next section
2. H **-iffə**, **-iffē**-, **-iffu**- ‘my’ (/i-w-/?); U **-mə** ‘to me’ < PIE **\*h<sub>1</sub>me** with m/F/w oscillation; compare Hittite **amm**- ‘me’ (*obl.*), Avestan **mē**, Khotanese **ma**, **mi** ‘me’, Armenian **im** ‘my’
3. H **fe(-)** ‘thou, you’, **-ffa** ‘you’ (*abs.*), **-m(ma)** ‘thou’ (*abs.*), **-v** / **-b** / **-p** ‘thy’, (/we-, -wa, -w/?), **-ū**, **-ō** ‘2<sup>nd</sup> person singular verb ending’; U **-w** ‘thou’ < PIE **\*wo-** ‘you’ with m/F/P/w oscillation; compare Sanskrit **va-**, Avestan **vō**, Khotanese **-ū**, OCS **vy**, and NC etymology #3 in next section
4. H **anV-** ‘that’, U **inV-** ‘demonstrative pronoun’ < PIE **\*h<sub>2</sub>eno-**; compare Armenian **n(a/o)-**, OCS **on-**, Sanskrit **aná-** etc.
5. H **andi**, **andu-** ‘this’ < H **anV-** + PIE **\*to-**; compare Armenian **d(a/o)-** ‘that (near you)’, Avestan **ta-** ‘this’ etc., and NC etymology #4 in next section.
6. H **oli**, U **ulə** ‘another’ < PIE **\*h<sub>2</sub>el-** / **\*h<sub>2</sub>ol-**; compare Latin **ollus**, Armenian **ayl** etc.
7. H **-ma-** / **-va-** ‘negative suffix for ergative verbs’; **va-**, **-ov-** ‘prohibitive’, U **mi** ‘prohibitive’, **ui** ‘not’ < PIE **\*meh<sub>1</sub>** / **\*mē** (with m/F/w oscillation); compare Armenian **mi**, Avestan **mā**, and NC etymology #5 in next section
8. H **oia** ‘no!’ < PIE **\*h<sub>2</sub>oiu**; compare Greek **ou**
9. H **-kkV** ‘negation of non-ergative verbs’, **-kk-** ‘negation of adjectives’ < PIE **\*(h<sub>2</sub>oiu-)kwi(d)**; compare Armenian **oč**, Greek **ouk**, **oukhí**
10. H **īa/e-** ‘relative pronoun’ < PIE **\*yo-**
11. H **ave-** ‘who’ < PIE **\*yo-**; compare Armenian **ov** ‘who’
12. H **-až** ‘plural morpheme’ (prob. /-as/) < PIE **\*-es**
13. H **ai** ‘if’; compare Greek (Dor., Eol.) **ai**, Phrygian **ai**
14. H **-ma** ‘connective’; compare Hittite **-ma** ‘and, but’
15. U **parə** ‘to, towards, on’ < PIE **\*pr-**
16. U **pei** ‘under’ (postposition) < PIE **\*h<sub>4</sub>upó**
17. H **tān-**, **tan-**, U **tan-** ‘to do’ < PIE **\*d<sup>h</sup>eh<sub>1</sub>-** ‘to put; to do’ with **\*-ne-** extension; compare Armenian **dn-em** ‘to put, do, build’, OCS **dě-ti** ‘to do, say’
18. H **tive**, **tia**, **tieni**, **tivi** ‘word’, U **ti-** ‘to speak’, **ti-nə** ‘name’ < PIE **\*d<sup>h</sup>eh<sub>1</sub>-**; compare Hittite **tē-** ‘to speak’, OCS **dě-ti** ‘to do, say’
19. H **taže** ‘present’ (prob. /tase/) < PIE **\*deh<sub>3</sub>-** with **\*-ti-** extension; compare Armenian **ta-** ‘to give’, Greek **dósis**, Latin **dōs**, **dōtis** ‘present’

- 20.H **mann-** ‘to be’, U **man-** ‘to be, exist’ < PIE **\*men-** ‘to remain, stay’; compare Armenian **mn-em**, Avestan **mān-** etc.
- 21.H **kad-** /kat-/ ‘to say, speak’ < PIE **\*gwet-** ‘to say’; compare Armenian **koč-**em ‘to call’, Gothic **qiþ-**an ‘to say, speak’
- 22.H **fur-** /wur-/ ‘to see’ < PIE **\*wer-**; compare Greek **oráō**
- 23.H, U **ar-** ‘to give’ < PIE **\*(H)reh<sub>1</sub>-** ‘to give’; compare Proto-Indo-Iranian **\*rā-s-** ‘to bestow, give’
- 24.H **šar-** ‘to desire, ask’ < PIE **\*ǵhor-** ‘to desire’; compare Old Avestan **zara** ‘goal’, Sanskrit **hárya-ti** ‘desires’
- 25.H **ūr-, ur-** ‘to want, desire’ < PIE **\*wel-**; compare Avestan **var-** ‘desire’, Latin **uol-, uel-** ‘to want’
- 26.H **tari** ‘fire’ < PIE **\*h<sub>2</sub>eh<sub>x</sub>t<sub>r</sub>**; compare Avestan **ātar-** and NC etymology #6 in next section
- 27.H **turi** ‘low, lower’ < PIE **\*nd<sup>h</sup>ero-**; compare Avestan **ađara-**
- 28.H **zur-gi** /sur-ki/ ‘blood’ < PIE **\*h<sub>1</sub>ésh<sub>2</sub>r-**; compare Sanskrit **ásṛk, ásrj-**
- 29.H **atta-i**, U **ate** ‘father’ < PIE **\*at-** / **\*h<sub>2</sub>et-**; compare Hittite, Greek **attas**, Latin, Gothic **atta**
- 30.H **šāl-a**, U **sələ** ‘daughter’ < PIE **\*seu(h<sub>x</sub>)-** + participial **\*-l-** (as in Armenian); compare English **son**, various NC parallels from PNC **\*-išwÉ(-rV-)** ‘son, daughter’ and Proto-Kartvelian **\*šw-il-** ‘born, son’
- 31.H **pura-**, U **pura** ‘slave’ < PIE **\*ph<sub>2</sub>u-ero-**; compare Latin **puer**
- 32.H **ešši, iššija-** ‘horse’ < PIE **\*h<sub>1</sub>ékwo-**; compare Sanskrit **áśvā-**, Khotanese **aśśa-** ‘horse’, Armenian **ēš** ‘donkey’, and NC etymology #8 in next section
- 33.H **avar-** ‘field’ < PHU **\*arwar** < PIE **\*h<sub>3</sub>erh<sub>3</sub>w<sub>r</sub>**; compare Armenian **harawunk’**, Greek **ároura**, etc.

## Conclusions

Etymologies listed above suggest that HU might be daughter (or possibly sister?) languages of PIE: this research thread seems to be worth continuing, in order to:

- identify additional cognates (ideally involving longer phoneme sequences and more numerous non-root etymologies);
- refine sound laws (including phonemic status of Hurrian voicing, and sound correspondences for vowels and laryngeals);
- collect evidence to understand whether HU are daughter or sister languages of PIE.

## North Caucasian (NC)

### NC languages

North Caucasian (NC) languages consist of the following **families** and SUB-FAMILIES:

### North-East Caucasian (NEC) = Nakh-Dagestanian

NAKH: Chechen, Ingush, Batsbi

AVAR-ANDI: Avar, Andi, Chadakolob, Akhvakh, Chamalal, Tindi, Karata, Botlikh, Bagvalal, Godoberi

TSEZIAN: Tsezi, Ginukh, Khvarshi, Inkhokvari, Bezhta, Gunzib

LAK-DARGWA: Lak, Akushi, Urakhi, Muiri, Kaitag, Tsudakhar, Kubachi, Chirag

LEZGHIAN: Lezghi, Tabasaran, Agul, Rutul, Tsakhur, Kryz, Budukh, Archi, Udi Khinalug

**North-West Caucasian (NWC):**

Abkhaz, Abaza

Adyghe, Kabardian

Ubykh

NEC and NWC are non-controversial families; their *sub*-families are even evident by inspection (possibly with the exception of Archi within Lezghian). Starostin and Nikolayev (among others) consider NEC and NWC related.

The following sub-section lists some striking parallels between (P)NC and (P)IE, which provide preliminary hints for a possible genetic relationship between NC and PIE. The source of (P)NC forms is [Starostin, Nikolayev 1994], with the following changes in transcription (to use IPA symbols instead of non-IPA ones):

SOUNDS		
Starostin's	Mine	Description
λ	ɬ	voiceless lateral fricative
λ̣	tɬ	voiceless lateral affricate
L	ɮ	voiced lateral fricative
Ľ	dɮ	voiced lateral affricate
c	ts	voiceless hissing affricate
č	tʃ	voiceless hushing affricate
ʒ	dʒ	voiced hissing affricate
ž	dʒ̣	voiced hushing affricate

DIACRITICS		
Starostin's	Mine	Description
.	◌̚	glottalized
˘	◌̟	palatalized
ı	◌̠	pharyngealized

Sample NC – PIE comparisons

1. PNC **\*zō(-n)**, **\*ʔez(V)** ‘I (first person singular pronoun)’: PIE **\*h<sub>1</sub>eǵ(ó(m))**  
NAKH: Chechen **so**, **as** (*erg.*); Ingush **so**, **az** (*erg.*); Batsbi **so**  
AVAR-ANDI: Chadakolob **dun**; Andi **din**; Akhvakh **dene**; Chamalal **dī**; Tindi **de**; Karata **den**; Botlikh **den(i)**; Bagvalal **dē**; Godoberi **den**; Avar **dun**  
TSEZIAN: Tsezi **dī**; Ginukh **de**; Khvarshi **da**; Inkhokvari **do**; Bezhta **do**; Gunzib **də**  
LAK-DARGWA: Lak **t:u-** (*obl.*); Chirag **du**  
LEZGHIAN: Lezghi **zun**; Tabasaran **uzu**; Agul **zun**; Rutul **zi**; Tsakhur **zu**; Kryz **zin**; Budukh **zin**; Archi **zon**; Udi **zu**  
Khinalug **zi**; **jä** (<**\*jaz**) (*erg.*)  
ABKHAZ-TAPANT: Abkhaz **sa-rá**; Abaza **sa-ra**  
ADYGHE-KABARDIAN: Adyghe **sa**; Kabardian **sa**  
Ubykh **sə-β<sup>wá</sup>**  
IRANIAN: Proto-Iranian **\*azam**; Old Avestan **azēm**; Young Avestan **azəm**; Sogdian **ʔw**; Khwaresmian **ʔz**; Ossetic **æz**; Khotanese **aysu**, **aysā**; Pashto **zə**, **zo**, **zA**, **zā**; Wanetsi **zA**; Yidgha **zo**; Munji **za**; Wakhi **wuz**; Parthian **ʔz**; Kurdish **ez**; Ormuri **az**, **az**; Old Persian **adam**  
Armenian **es**  
Also compare HU etymology #1  
Comment: AVAR-ANDI, TSEZIAN and LAK-DARGWA share **\*ǵ** > d with Persian. NC reflexes and PIE parallels might lead to a revised PNC reconstruction **\*ez**, **\*(e)zó(n)**
2. PNEC **\*dū** ‘thou (oblique base)’: PIE **\*tuh<sub>x</sub>**, **\*te(we)**  
AVAR-ANDI: Chadakolob, Andi, Akhvakh, Chamalal, Tindi, Karata, Botlikh, Bagvalal, Godoberi, Avar **du-**  
TSEZIAN: Tsezi, Ginukh, Khvarshi **de-b-**; Inkhokvari **du-b-**; Bezhta **dī-b-** / **du-**; Gunzib **dī-b-** / **du-**  
IRANIAN: Proto-Iranian **\*taua**; Avestan **tu**, **tṵēm**, **tum**, **θvaṃ**, **tōi**, **tē**; Sogdian **tw**’; Ossetic **dæw** (*gen.*); Khotanese **thu**, **thā**, **tha**, **tä**, **te**; Pashto **tA**, **to**, **t<sup>h</sup>A**, **tə**; Wanetsi **ta**, **tA**; Ormuri **tu**; Old Persian **tuvam**, **taiy**; Middle Persian **tō**  
Armenian **du**  
Comment: compare Ossetic and Armenian for **\*t-** > d-; this pronoun is in almost complementary distribution with the following one in NC sub-families.
3. PNC **\*uō(-)** ‘thou’: PIE **\*wo-** ‘you’ (plural and dual)  
LAK-DARGWA: Lak **wi**  
LEZGHIAN: Lezghi, Agul **wun**; Tabasaran **uwu**; Rutul **wī**; Tsakhur **wu**; Kryz, Budukh **win**; Archi, Udi **un**  
Khinalug **wī**  
ABKHAZ-TAPANT: Abkhaz **wa-rá**; Abaza **wa-ra**  
ADYGHE-KABARDIAN: Adyghe, Kabardian **wa**

Ubykh **wə-ɪʷá**

IRANIAN: Proto-Iranian **\*vah**; Avestan **vō**; Khotanese **ahā, ahu, -ū, uhu**

Comment: for the semantic shift ‘you (plur.)’ > ‘thou’ compare, e.g., English; this pronoun is in almost complementary distribution with the previous one in NC sub-families.

4 PNC **\*dV** ‘that’: PIE **\*to-**

NAKH: Chechen **dʃā** (< **\*da-ħa**); Ingush **dʃa** (< **\*da-ħa**); Batsbi **da-ħ**

AVAR-ANDI: Botlikh, Avar **do-b**

LEZGHIAN: Tabasaran **du-mu**; Udi **t:e**

Khinalug **du** ‘this’

ABKHAZ-TAPANT: Abkhaz, Abaza **-da**

ADYGHE-KABARDIAN: Adyghe, Kabardian **-da**

IRANIAN: Avestan **ta-**; Khotanese **tta-** ‘this’; Pashto **da, dΛγΛ** ‘this’; Wanetsi **da, dΛγΛ** ‘this’

Armenian **da-, do-** ‘that (near you)’

Also compare HU etymology #5

Comment: \*t- > d- as in comparison #2 (PNC **\*dū** : PIE **\*tuh<sub>x</sub>**)

5. PNC **\*ma** / **\*mə** ‘prohibitive particle’: PIE **\*meh<sub>1</sub>**, **\*mē**

NAKH: Chechen, Ingush, Batsbi **ma**

LAK-DARGWA: Lak **ma**

LEZGHIAN: Lezghi **-mir**; Tabasaran, Agul, Rutul, Tsakhur, Kryz, Budukh **m-**;

Udi **ma**

ABKHAZ-TAPANT: Abkhaz, Abaza **m-** ‘neg., prohib.’

ADYGHE-KABARDIAN: Adyghe, Kabardian **mə-**

Ubykh **-m(a)-** ‘neg., prohib.’

Sanskrit **mā**

IRANIAN: Avestan, Old Persian **mā**; Khotanese **ma**

Armenian **mi**; some Armenian dialects **mír** (compare Lezghi)

Also compare HU etymology #7

Comment: also extended to general negative particle in some NWC languages; further comparisons with Proto-Kartvelian **\*ma-** and Proto-Turkic **\*-ma-** ‘not’ are also possible.

6. PNC **\*tʰājī** ‘fire’: PIE **\*h<sub>2</sub>eh<sub>1</sub>tr̥**

NAKH: Chechen **tʰe, tʰera-**; Ingush **tʰi, tsero**; Batsbi **tʰe, tʰari-**

AVAR-ANDI: Chadakolob **tʰa**; Andi **tʰa**; Akhvakh **tʰari**; Chamalal, Tindi **tʰā**;

Karata, Botlikh **tʰaj**; Bagvalal **tʰaj**; Godoberi **tʰaji**; Avar **tʰa**

TSEZIAN: Tsezi **tʰi**; Ginukh **tʰe**; Khvarshi **tʰa**; Inkhokvari, Bezhta **tʰo**; Gunzib **tʰə**

LAK-DARGWA: Lak **tʰu, tʰara-**; Akushi, Urakhi, Tsudakhar, Kubachi **tʰa**;

Chirag **tsa**

LEZGHIAN: Lezghi **tʰaj**; Tabasaran **tsa**; Agul **tʰa**; Rutul **tsaj**; Tsakhur **tʰa**; Kryz **tʰā**;

Budukh **tsə**; Archi **ots**; Udi **ar-uχ** (< plur.)

Khinalug ʃʰä

IRANIAN: Proto-Iranian \*āθra-; Avestan ātar-, āθr-; Sogdian ‘tr, ‘rδ; Khwarezmian ‘rw; Ossetic art; Yaghnobi āl; Pashto or, oʻr, wor, yer; Wanetsi awar; Shughni yōc; Yazgulami yec; Sariqoli yuc; Kurdish ār; Baluchi ās, āč; Ormuri rawā; Middle Persian ādur

Also compare HU etymology #26

Comments: remarkable parallels include: Udi ar- vs. Kurdish ār and Pashto or; Archi oʻs vs. Baluchi ās, āč, Shughni yōc, Sariqoli yuc (and maybe Proto-Turkic \*ōt ‘fire’). Several NC oblique stems may lead to a revised PNC reconstruction \*tsʰāř.

7. PNC \*dzwähri / \*dzwähri ‘star’: PIE \*h<sub>2</sub>stér

NAKH: Batsbi tʰejri

AVAR-ANDI: Chadakolob tʰwa; Andi tʰ:a; Akhvakh tʰ:wari; Chamalal sʰā; Tindi tʰ:aru; Karata tʰ:wai; Botlikh tʰ:aj; Bagvalal tʰ:wara; Godoberi tʰ:aji; Avar tʰ:wa

TSEZIAN: Tsezi tsa; Ginukh tʰwa; Khvarshi tsa; Inkhokvari tsā; Bezhta tsā; Gunzib tsa

LAK-DARGWA: Lak tʰu-ku, tʰur-; Akushi urʔi; Urakhi urʔi; Tsudakhar zuri; Kubachi di(ʔi); Chirag zure

ABKHAZ-TAPANT: Abkhaz á-jetʰwa; Abaza jatʰwa

Ubykh tʰwa(n)-ki

Sanskrit t̄aras

IRANIAN: Avestan star-; Sogdian ‘stʰrk, ‘stry; Khwarezmian stʰryk; Ossetic stʰaly / (æ)stʰalu; Khotanese st̄araa-; Pashto stōrai (<\*st̄araka-), starga, store/a/a; Wanetsi stori; Yidgha st̄arē; Wakhi sit̄ar; Sangl. ust̄ruk; Shughni x̄it̄arj; Yazg x̄it̄arj, x̄tarag; Sariqoli x̄iturj; Kurdish istirk; Baluchi ist̄ar, ast̄ar; Parachi est̄ēč; Ormuri starrak, storak, stora<sup>1</sup>; Middle Persian ‘stʰrg, st̄arag Armenian ast̄; Armenian dialects ast̄-, usd̄, as̄, ar̄est̄ot-, os̄, osx, asox, ask  
Comment: NC forms may derive from a “pre-PNC” \*\*Vhtér-; a further comparison with Proto-Turkic \*jułduř is also possible (if from \*\*jVštVr)

8. PNC \*hi[n]ʃwi/ě ‘horse’: PIE \*h<sub>1</sub>ékwos ‘horse’, \*h<sub>1</sub>ékweh<sub>a</sub>- ‘mare’

AVAR-ANDI: Chadakolob ʃu ‘horse’; Andi iʃa ‘mare’; Akhvakh iʃwa ‘mare’; Chamalal iša ‘mare’; Tindi iʃwa ‘mare’; Karata iʃwa ‘mare’; Botlikh iʃa ‘mare’; Bagvalal iʃw ‘mare’; Godoberi iʃa ‘mare’; Avar ʃu ‘horse’

LAK-DARGWA: Lak ʃwu; Akushi urʃi; Urakhi urʃi; Kubachi uʃe; Chirag urʃe

Khinalug pʃi

ABKHAZ-TAPANT: Abkhaz a-ʃó; Abaza ʃə

ADYGHE-KABARDIAN: Adyghe, Kabardian šə

Ubykh ʃə

Sanskrit áśvā-

IRANIAN: Proto-Iranian \*aswā- (fem.); Avestan aspa- ‘horse’, aspā ‘mare’; Sogdian ‘sp; Ossetic j̄æfs / æafsæ ‘mare’; Khotanese aśsa-, aśa-; Pashto ās ‘horse’, āspa ‘mare’; Wakhi yaš; Old Persian asa-; Middle Pers ‘sp



Armenian **ēš** ‘donkey’

Also compare HU etymology #32

Comment: NC reflexes and PIE parallels might lead to a revised PNC reconstruction **\*eǵw-**; one might also compare Proto-Turkic **\*āt** ‘horse’

9. PNC **\*jĕrk<sup>o</sup>wī** ‘heart’: PIE **\*kerd-**

NAKH: Chechen **dog**; Ingush **dog**; Batsbi **dok<sup>o</sup>**

AVAR-ANDI: Chadakolob **rak<sup>o</sup>**; Andi **rok<sup>o</sup>wo**; Akhvakh **rak<sup>o</sup>wa**; Chamalal **jak<sup>o</sup>wa**; Tindi **rak<sup>o</sup>wa**; Karata **rak<sup>o</sup>wa**; Botlikh **rak<sup>o</sup>wa**; Bagvalal **rak<sup>o</sup>wa**; Godoberi **rak<sup>o</sup>wa**; Avar **rak<sup>o</sup>**

TSEZIAN: Tsezi **rok<sup>o</sup>u**; Ginukh **rok<sup>o</sup>(w)e**; Khvarshi **lok<sup>o</sup>wa**; Inkhokvari **lok<sup>o</sup>o**; Bezhta **rak<sup>o</sup>o**; Gunzib **rok<sup>o</sup>u**

LAK-DARGWA: Lak **dak<sup>o</sup>**; Akushi **urk<sup>o</sup>i**; Urakhi **urk<sup>o</sup>i**; Tsudakhar **urf<sup>o</sup>i**; Kubachi **ūk<sup>o</sup>e**; Chirag **urf<sup>o</sup>e**

LEZGHIAN: Lezghi **rik<sup>o</sup>**; Tabasaran **juk<sup>o</sup>**; Agul **jurk<sup>o</sup>**; Rutul **jik<sup>o</sup>**; Tsakhur **jik<sup>o</sup>**; Kryz **jik<sup>o</sup>**; Budukh **jik<sup>o</sup>**; Archi **ik<sup>o</sup>w**; Udi **uk**:

Khinalug **ung**

ABKHAZ-TAPANT: Abkhaz **a-g<sup>w</sup>ó**; Abaza **g<sup>w</sup>ə**

ADYGHE-KABARDIAN: Adyghe **g<sup>w</sup>ə**; Kabardian **g<sup>w</sup>ə**

Ubykh **gja**

IRANIAN: Proto-Iranian **\*zrd-**; Avestan **zərəd**; Sogdian **δrz** < **\*zrδ**; Ossetic **zærdæ**; Khotanese **ysāra-**, **ysaraka**, **ysir-**, **ysīr-(ak-)**; Pashto **zrə**, **zera**, **zla**; Wanetsi **zra**; Yidgha **zil**, **zēl**, **z<sup>e</sup>la**; Munji **zilgy**; Shughni **zārδ**, **zōrδ**; Yazg **zawδ**; Sariqoli **zārd**, **zorδ**, **zord**; Parthian **zyrd**; Parachi **zur**; Ormuri **zli**, **z<sup>a</sup>li**; Middle Persian **dyl**

Armenian **sirt**

SLAVIC: OCS **srědъce**, Russian **sérdce**, etc.

Comment: NC reflexes offer a very complex picture, which can be better understood in the light of PNC reconstruction **\*jĕrk<sup>o</sup>wī**, possibly from “pre-PNC” **\*zVrdV-k-** (similar to Khotanese and OCS) > **\*jVrVk(w)-** / **\*(jV)dVk-**. These revised proto-forms, together with Agul **jurk<sup>o</sup>**, also suggest a comparison with Proto-Turkic **\*jürek** ‘heart’. On the other hand, NWC forms (such as Abaza, Adyghe and Kabardian **g<sup>w</sup>ə**) can be compared with Kartvelian (=South-Caucasian) terms such as Svan **gwi-**, **gu(h)-** and Laz **gu(r)-** ‘heart’ < Proto-Kartvelian **\*gul-**

10. PNC **\*tshĕ** ‘one’: PIE **\*h<sub>1</sub>oi-wo-**

NAKH: Chechen **tsha?**; Ingush **tsa?**; Batsbi **tsha**

AVAR-ANDI: Chadakolob **šo**; Andi **se-w**; Akhvakh **ŕe-be**; Chamalal **se-b**; Tindi **se-b**; Karata **tse-b**; Botlikh **se-b** / **tse-b**; Bagvalal **se-b** / **tse-b**; Godoberi **se-b**; Avar **so**

TSEZIAN: Tsezi **sis**; Ginukh **hes**; Khvarshi **has**; Inkhokvari **hos**; Bezhta **hōs**; Gunzib **hōs**

LAK-DARGWA: Lak **tsa**; Akushi **tsa**; Urakhi **tsa**; Kubachi **sa**; Chirag **tsa**

LEZGHIAN: Lezghi **sa**; Tabasaran **sa**; Agul **sad**; Rutul **sa**; Tsakhur **sa**; Kryz **säd**;

Budukh **sad**; Archi **os**; Udi **sa**

Khinalug **sa**

ABKHAZ-TAPANT: Abkhaz **z-nə** ‘once’; Abaza **za-k’ə**

ADYGHE-KABARDIAN: Adyghe **zə**; Kabardian **zə**

Ubykh **za**

IRANIAN: Proto-Iranian **\*aiwa-**; Avestan **aēva-**, **aēuua-**; Sogdian **‘yw**; Khwaresmian **‘yw**; Ossetic **iw / (j)ew**; Khotanese **śśau**, **śśā**, **śye**, **śi**, **śe**, **śo** etc. < **\*yūva** < **\*aiwa-**, **śū** ‘only, alone’, **śśūka-** ‘alone’; Pashto **yau**, **yaw**, **yō**; Yidgha **yū**; Munji **yū**; Wakhi **īu**; Sanglechi **wok**, **yak**; Shughni **yī(w)**; Yazgulami **yū**, **wū(g)**; Sariqoli **ī(w)**; Baluchi **ēyōk** ‘single’, **evak’ā** ‘alone’; Parachi **žū** < **\*yau** < **\*aiwa-**; Ormuri **šē**, **sə**, **sa**; Old Persian **aiva**; Middle Persian **ē(v)**

Comment: Khotanese, Parachi and Ormuri forms are particularly close to NC forms; Abaza **za-k’ə** and Khotanese **śśūka-** also suggest a comparison with Hurrian **šukki** ‘one’.

#### 11. PNC **\*(t)qHwā** ‘two’: PIE **\*dwoh<sub>3</sub>(u)**

AVAR-ANDI: Chadakolob **ki-gu**; Andi **ŋe-gu**; Akhvakh **ke-da**; Chamalal **eŋi-da**; Tindi **ke-ja**; Karata **k’e-da**; Botlikh **ke-da**; Bagvalal **ke-ra**; Godoberi **k’e-da**; Avar **ki-go**

TSEZIAN: Tsezi **q’ano**; Ginukh **q’ono**; Khvarshi **q’wene**; Inkhokvari **q’une**; Bezhta **qona**; Gunzib **q’anu**

LAK-DARGWA: Lak **k’i=a**; Akushi **kel**; Urakhi **kwi**; Kubachi **kwe**; Chirag **ŋ’wal**

LEZGHIAN: Lezghi **qwe-d**; Tabasaran **q’u**; Agul **q’u-d**; Rutul **q’wad**; Tsakhur **q’o-lla**; Kryz **q’wad**; Budukh **qa-b**; Archi **q’we**; Udi **p:a’**

Khinalug **k’u**

ABKHAZ-TAPANT: Abkhaz **ŋw-bá**; Abaza **ŋw-ba**

ADYGHE-KABARDIAN: Adyghe **twə**; Kabardian **twə**

Ubykh **t’qwa**

IRANIAN: Proto-Iranian **\*duwai-**; Avestan **dva** (*masc.*), **baē** (*fem., neuter*), **bi-**; Sogdian **(‘)δw’**; Ossetic **dywwæ**, **duwæ / duw(w)æ**; Yagnobi **du**; Khotanese **d(u)va**; **śāta-**, **śe** ‘second’ < **\*dwi-ta-**; Pashto **dwa**; Wanetsi **dwē**; Yidgha **loh**; Munji **lu**; Wakhi **bū(i)**; Sanglechi **dōu**; Shughni **du**; Yazgulami **du**; Kurdish **do**; Baluchi **do**; Ormuri **dio**; Middle Persian **dō**

Armenian **erku** < Proto-Armenian **\*tkwu**

Comment: PNC **\*(t)qHwā** and Ubykh **t’qwa** are very close to Proto-Armenian **\*tkwu** ‘two’ and Proto-Kartvelian **\*t’qub-** ‘twins’. Proto-Turkic **\*ek(k)i** might also be compared, if < **\*etkw-** (with prothetical **\*e-** as in Armenian **erku**). Adyghe and Kabardian **twə** are very close to Pashto **dwa** etc. Udi **p:a’** can be compared with Avestan **baē** and Wakhi **bū(i)**.

#### 12. PNC **\*tHē** ‘three’: PIE **\*tréyes**, **\*trih<sub>3</sub>**

AVAR-ANDI: Chadakolob **táb-gu**; Andi **lob-gu**; Akhvakh **t’wa-dabe / tlo-dabe**; Chamalal **la-la-da**; Tindi **lab-da**; Karata **lab-da**; Botlikh **habu-da**; Bagvalal **lab-da**; Godoberi **labu-da**; Avar **táb-go**

TSEZIAN: Tsezi **to<sup>o</sup>no**; Ginukh **tono**; Khvarshi **tona**; Inkhokvari **hono**; Bezhta **łana**; Gunzib **łono**

LAK-DARGWA: Akushi **ha<sup>o</sup>ba-al**; Urakhi **ha<sup>o</sup>b**; Kubachi **fa<sup>o</sup>b**; Chirag **fa<sup>o</sup>b-al**

LEZGHIAN: Lezghi **p:u-d** < **\*xp:u-d**; Tabasaran **šubu-b**; Agul **xibu-d**; Rutul **xibi-d**; Tsakhur **xebi-llä**; Kryz **šibi-d**; Budukh **šubu-d**; Archi **teb**; Udi **χib**

ABKHAZ-TAPANT: Abkhaz **χ-pa**; Abaza **χ-pa**

ADYGHE-KABARDIAN: Adyghe **šə**; Kabardian **śə**

Ubykh **śa, śə**

IRANIAN: Proto-Iranian **\*θrayah**; Avestan **θrayō, θri, tišrō**; Sogdian **δry**; Khwaresmian **šy**; Ossetic **artæ**; Yagnobi **χurói**; Khotanese **drai**; Pashto **drē**; Yidgha **χuri**; Munji **χirói**; Wakhi **trūi**; Sanglechi **rōi**; Shughni **arāi**; Yazgulami **χurói**; Sariqoli **aroy**; Baluchi **sai**; Parachi **št**; Ormuri **šrī, či**; Middle Persian **sē**

Armenian **erek', eri-**, Armenian dialects **že-, še-**

Comment: PNC **\*tHē** and PIE **\*treye-** are remarkably close per se. NWC forms such as Adyghe **šə**, Ubykh **śa, śə** are close to e.g. Khwaresmian **šy**, Parachi **št**, Middle Persian **sē**, Armenian dialects **že-, še-**. If frequent **-b** or **-nV** extensions in NC can legitimately be compared with Proto-Kartvelian **\*-m**, then Proto-Kartvelian **\*sam** ‘three’ could also be added to these comparisons.

### *Preliminary conclusions*

These comparisons between NC and IE languages (in particular, Iranian and Armenian) are intriguing enough to encourage further analysis. The accumulation of further comparisons is necessary to identify regular sound correspondences and to rule out the possibility that this initial set of comparanda is due to chance resemblances and/or loans (instead of genetic relatedness). Some parallels also suggest that Turkic languages (and possibly Kartvelian ones) should be included in the research and might even be ultimately derivable directly from PIE (rather than from a higher-level proto-language such as putative “Proto-Nostratic”).

### Bibliography

Bailey 1979

H. W. Bailey, *Dictionary of Khotan Saka*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press

Cheung 2002

J. Cheung, *Studies in the Historical Development of the Ossetic Vocalism*, Wiesbaden, Dr. Ludwig Reichert Verlag

Colarusso 1997

J. Colarusso, *Proto-Pontic: Phyletic links between Proto-Indo-European and Proto-Northwest Caucasian*, *Journal of Indo-European Studies* 25, pp. 119–51

Fähnrich, Sardshweladse 1995

H. Fähnrich, S. Sardshweladse, *Etymologisches Wörterbuch der Kartwel-Sprachen*, Leiden-New York, Brill

Klimov 1998

G. A. Klimov, *Etymological Dictionary of the Kartvelian Languages*, Berlin-New York, Mouton de Gruyter

Mallory, Adams 2006

J. P. Mallory, D. Q. Adams, *The Oxford Introduction to Proto-Indo-European and the Proto-Indo-European World*, Oxford, Oxford University Press

Martirosyan 2010

H. K. Martirosyan, *Etymological Dictionary of the Armenian Inherited Lexicon*, Leiden-Boston, Brill

Starostin, Dybo, Mudrak 2003

S. Starostin, A. Dybo, O. Mudrak, *Etymological Dictionary of the Altaic Languages*, Leiden-Boston, Brill

Starostin, Nikolayev 1994

S. A. Starostin, S. I. Nikolayev, *A North Caucasian Etymological Dictionary*, Ann Arbor, Caravan Books, 2007

Wilhelm 2008a

G. Wilhelm, *Hurrian*, in R. D. Woodard (ed.), *The Ancient Languages of Asia Minor*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, pp. 81-104

Wilhelm 2008b

G. Wilhelm, *Urartian*, in R. D. Woodard (ed.), *The Ancient Languages of Asia Minor*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, pp. 105-123

Intervengono: Milani, Vai, Soldani, Fortuna, Borghi.  
La seduta è tolta alle ore 18.50

## SEDUTA DEL 16/1/2012

Presenti: Borghi, De Marchi, Fortuna, Lozza, Milani, Scala, Sgarbi, Soldani, Vai.  
Presiede Milani.  
La seduta ha inizio alle ore 17.

## COMUNICAZIONE:

### **R. SGARBI, *Contributo all'ermeneutica neotestamentaria di Mt 5, 17-19.***

Per una paradigmatica autocertificazione circa la posizione del pensiero e del comportamento di Gesù di Nazaret nei confronti del *corpus* della Legge ebraica, quella detta 'mosaica' o *Tōrāh* e quella onnicomprensiva o *Miṣvah*, possiamo riferirci alla seguente apodittica pericope neotestamentaria del testo greco dell'evangelo matteo (Mt 5, 17-19) nell'edizione critica stoccardiana pubblicata da Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft<sup>1</sup>

1. E. E. NESTLE - B. K. ALAND *et al.*, *The Greek New Testament*, Stuttgart 1993<sup>27</sup>. Per i compendia