

A MARRIAGE OF EPHEMERAL DISCOURSES: NEWSPAPERS AND MOVING PICTURES

Richard Abel, Drake University

Where next? As the essays in this initial issue of *CINEMA & Cie* attest, historians and theoreticians of early cinema are far from unanimous in responding to that simple question. Instead of taking stock of my own research over the past twenty years, an exercise in self-reflection that engaged my attention several years ago,¹ I have decided to survey one of several recent trajectories that research has taken. One is premised on defining early cinema as a *son-et-lumière* event and hence focuses on recovering the multitude of sound practices that played a significant role in its development, especially in exhibition.² Another is premised on defining early cinema, on an international level, as initially so dominated by the French, especially Pathé-Frères, that the initial development of many “national cinemas” – from the United States to Russia – could only emerge in relation to that dominance, either through imitation or the construction of difference.³ The trajectory I want to pursue in this essay, however, is premised on defining early cinema as a unique point of intersection between a new mass market cultural product and pre-existing as well as innovative local or regional cultural practices, specifically in an industrialized country such as the USA. Traces of that intersection survive in newspaper discourse on “the movies” – that is, in an equally ephemeral medium – and can be quite revealing about the circulation, promotion, and reception of moving pictures, particularly when rental companies, exhibitors, and newspapermen (and women) went through an extended “courtship” and “trial marriage” in the early 1910s.⁴

For the past few years, my research on silent cinema in the USA (specifically in the early 1910s) has lured me into looking just as closely at old newspapers on library microfilm readers as at old movies on archive steenbecks. One of the more surprising finds in this line of research came in reading the *Des Moines News*, an Iowa newspaper that had eluded me during the time I was writing *The Red Rooster Scare*.⁵ Although the *News* carried advertisements for several local moving picture theaters quite regularly from the fall of 1911 on, I was unprepared for a front page story on November 11, 1912. Under a filmstrip banner labeled *The Movies* was a story about the famous wager in Palo Alto, California, in 1872, that led Eadweard Muybridge to “invent” moving pictures. Filling out this story were a variety of “big facts” about the current industry that had grown up from this invention, along with a thumbnail sketch of its “three branches: *manufacturer, renter, and exhibitor*.”⁶ The writer was “Gertrude M. Price, the Daily News’ Moving Picture Expert,” and on the following page was a bold announcement that she would be entertaining readers almost daily with stories about the “Moving Picture Folks” – especially “favorites” such as “that Smiley, Golden-Haired Girl” (most

likely, Mary Pickford) – because the *News* “recogniz[ed] ‘the movies’ as the biggest, most popular amusement in the world.” The next day, as promised, not only did a photo story on Dolores Cassinelli (from Essanay’s Chicago studio) appear but so did another banner story about the movie business in Des Moines (the state capital, with a population of 85,000), claiming that the city’s fourteen moving picture houses had a daily attendance of ten thousand – and that was a “conservative estimate.”⁷

However unusual these stories in the *Des Moines News* seem (and I will return to them later), they did not lack for precedents of one kind or another. As early as October 1910, for instance, the *Youngstown Vindicator* printed a story about why so many people in this northeastern Ohio city of 80,000 “visit[ed] the local picture shows,” why “no other institution in the city quite fill[ed] the place” of its nine moving picture theaters.⁸ Within another year, the paper’s Sunday edition was carrying an unsigned column called “Week in Moving Picture Theaters” that described and remarked on the films featured in at least four of those theaters, whose ads competed with the even larger, bolder ones of the city’s three vaudeville houses.⁹ Similarly, in May 1911, in Cleveland (a city of more than 500,000 people, fifty miles northwest of Youngstown), the drama critic of the *Cleveland Leader’s* Sunday edition not only acknowledged that “the public [was] talking about the picture-plays it sees just as it talks of the flesh-and-blood ones” – and a much “bigger section” of the public – but admitted that he himself found them “vastly entertaining.”¹⁰ By December, the *Sunday Leader* was printing a full page devoted to “Photo-Plays and Players,” edited by Ralph Stoddard and supported by ads for up to twenty-five theaters as well as several film rental firms and slide manufacturers or renters.¹¹ This page offered not only “news of Cleveland’s leading picture theatres” but a “review of the feature films of the week.” Yet the first paper to take “the movies” seriously, as Robert Grau long ago noted, was the *New York Morning Telegraph*.¹² For that paper’s Sunday edition, perhaps as early as January 1909, Ellis Cohen, a former editor of *Views and Films Index*, was writing a page entitled “In the Moving Picture Field,” supported by ads for several film manufacturers and renters.¹³ Within two years, the *Telegraph* had come to accept “the stability of [this] new form of entertainment” and, as a consequence, in February 1911, added a new department to its Sunday staff, probably headed by George Terwilliger, in order to produce what soon became two full pages devoted to “Motion Pictures and Photo-Plays.”¹⁴ The most prominent features of these pages were the columns of short, unsigned “Critical Reviews” of both licensed and independent films released that week.

Daily newspapers, of course, long have been a valuable resource for anyone researching American cinema after the middle or late 1910s; before then, however, they rarely have been consulted by cinema historians.¹⁵ The reason is obvious enough for the nickelodeon period: moving picture exhibitors initially had little need of newspapers for advertising purposes – and the papers reciprocated by giving the picture shows little attention. With the exception of some smaller cities and towns, and for brief periods of time, this relative absence of discursive traces (other than in city directories and scattered magazine articles) rendered “nickelodeon culture” more or less “invisible.”¹⁶ The same cannot be said for the “little noticed period of the early 1910s that bridge[d] the nickelodeon and the palace,” to quote an architectural historian, when the emergence of “Modern Moving Picture Theaters” came to represent the most important changes in architectural design, programming, publicity, and movie-going habits.¹⁷ For, as the managers of these new theaters bought advertising space on a regular basis, local

papers, in turn, devoted stories, columns, and even pages to the ever more popular “movies” and picture shows. Indeed, examining these columns and pages and the kinds of ads, articles, and reviews they featured can be quite revealing. Not only do they help us map changes in the exhibition venues for moving pictures in particular cities over time, but they allow us to trace the distribution and exhibition of moving pictures in specific venues as well as the program formats and promotional frameworks within which they circulated and were made available to audiences – and what audiences that programming and publicity assumed. Moreover, this discourse on moving pictures can be read in relation to that of other newspaper matter – editorials, news events, stories of crime, reports on legal and political conflicts, stories of building projects, special columns for women and children, comic strips – as well as the more familiar discourse of the trade press.¹⁸ The results of such a closer look at newspapers, I would argue, can lead to a much better understanding of what shaped the reception and meaning of moving pictures in the USA during the early 1910s – and such research may serve as a useful model for other countries.

Sunday Pages and Programs, and Other Novelties

The four newspapers just cited contain a wealth of material that at first may seem overwhelming. Moreover, they covered moving pictures from different perspectives and were published in different kinds of cities in three different regions of the country – all of which were crucial to the emergence of nickelodeons and moving picture theaters –¹⁹ so it is worth situating each paper, along with several others introduced briefly for purposes of comparison, more clearly at the outset.

The *Sunday Telegraph*, for instance, was unusual for more than being the first newspaper to devote a weekly page or section to moving pictures. Among New York newspapers, its principal subjects – sports, finance, and the arts – and style linked it more closely to the “information” of the *Times* and *Tribune* than to the “sensationalism” of the *Journal* or *World*, making the circulation claim for its Sunday edition (“650,000-750,000 men and women”) remarkable.²⁰ Initially, moving pictures and vaudeville were treated together in a separate section of the Sunday paper; yet, by early 1912, under the editorship of Terwilliger and then Tracy H. Lewis (along with “a staff of four assistants”), an entire section was devoted to moving pictures, which eventually was sold as a separate paper, with a “half-tone colored supplement.”²¹ Given the ads it accepted, the stories it sometimes reprinted from other papers, and the extensive reviews of individual films it published weekly, the *Telegraph’s* motion picture section seemed to assume a core readership made up largely of exhibitors. In scope and reach, this section rivaled that of the trade press – e.g., *Film Index*, *Moving Picture World*, *New York Dramatic Mirror*, *Moving Picture News*.²² In late March 1911, an ad boasted that in the previous month the *Sunday Telegraph* had gained 1,600 new subscribers from exhibitors, many of them located outside New York City; several weeks later, another bragged that more exhibitors read the *Sunday Telegraph* than all other trade publications combined.²³ Hot air? Perhaps not. How else could the motion picture section have expanded to six full pages of photos, ads, stories, and reviews by March 1912? Within another year or so, Grau even claimed that, “among moving picture actors, theatre owners, manufacturers and all those interested in the trade, circu-

lation had reached nearly 16,000," a significant number of those engaged in the industry.²⁴

In northeastern Ohio, a crucial section of the country's industrial "heartland," the *Leader* played a somewhat similar role to that of the *Telegraph*.²⁵ It had been the most successful and influential paper in Cleveland until 1900, when it was displaced (and later acquired) by the *Plain Dealer*.²⁶ Its Sunday edition, however, remained one of the best anywhere well into the 1910s, especially in its coverage of politics, on which it took an explicitly Progressive position,²⁷ and cultural events and issues, which extended from the magazine section and several pages on theater, music, and art to special "Cosmopolitan" and "Metropolitan" sections.²⁸ Subscribers ranged far beyond Cleveland: in September 1911, for instance, the special admission coupons it began printing each Sunday (a full page of them) could be redeemed in theaters throughout northern Ohio and northwestern Pennsylvania.²⁹ This suggested a readership that included far more than exhibitors, which the *Photo-Plays and Players* page confirmed when it first appeared in December. Certain ads clearly were directed at exhibitors – especially those for independent firms such as Lake Shore Film & Supply – as was a series of stories on major figures involved in renting or exhibiting in the city – such as E. Mandelbaum, who founded Lake Shore, later partly owned Mutual, and then headed World Special Film.³⁰ But, unlike the *Sunday Telegraph*, the *Sunday Leader* aimed most of its page at those who attended moving pictures as a legitimate new cultural form. The small but numerous theater ads attested to that, of course, but so did the weekly *Gallery of Popular Photo Players*, beginning with Marion Leonard, Maurice Costello, and Kathlyn Williams, in January 1912, as did the lengthy columns that, in listing and commenting on the Sunday or even weekly programs shown in those theaters, were intended as "a guide to fans."³¹

The *Youngstown Vindicator* generally shared the Progressive views of the *Leader* and, as the dominant newspaper in a "bold, vulgar" steel-producing center, saw itself as a standard-bearer of political and moral reform.³² In the first decade of the century, it had fought to control and limit saloons, supported a police crackdown on the illegal activities of the Italian "Black Hand," and expressed repeated concern for the assimilation of immigrants through education. Beginning in the fall of 1911, its Sunday edition (which simply expanded the paper's usual length) began to devote two or three pages to theatrical entertainments – just as did the *Canton News*, a more "sensational" paper in another, slightly smaller center of steel production fifty miles to the southwest, and south of Cleveland.³³ In one city, moving picture information often seemed aimed at the shoppers, young couples, families, and children the *Vindicator* imagined were their fans; in the other, it assumed an audience dominated by "the working man and his family."³⁴ The *Vindicator's* "Week in Moving Pictures" columns selected one or more films to promote each day at the Dome, Palace, and Orpheum, supplemented by brief stories such as a very early appreciation, in October 1911, of G. M. "Bullets" Anderson, the hero of so many Essanay westerns.³⁵ Within a year, the *Vindicator* had doubled the number of regular moving picture theaters that advertised regularly, and the "Week in Moving Pictures" columns occasionally reprinted bits of news from the trade press – for instance, Universal was releasing its own *Animated Weekly* newsreel, and the MPPC had licensed Famous Players' four-reel *Queen Elizabeth*, with Sarah Bernhardt.³⁶ By the spring of 1913, C. W. Deibel claimed, 50,000 people were attending the city's theaters weekly.³⁷

As the capital city of a largely agricultural state in the upper Midwest, Des Moines was an insurance and banking center, with a growing population of “white collar” service workers, many of them women.³⁸ Of the two major newspapers in the city (the other, the *Register and Leader*, would acquire it in the early 1920s), the *News* was not only more “sensational” but strongly supportive of labor unions.³⁹ Yet, much like the *Leader* and *Vindicator*, it had Progressive leanings, including a strong advocacy of the suffragette movement.⁴⁰ Both Des Moines papers were giving more and more attention to moving pictures by the end of 1912, but the *Register* confined its interest to accepting ads from a couple of theaters – as did the *Cedar Rapids Republican*, the major paper in a more industrialized city of 30,000 in northeast Iowa.⁴¹ In hiring Gertrude Price as a “movie expert” in November that year, the *News* alone recognized that moving pictures had become an important subject for its readers. Not only did Price write short illustrated stories almost daily about movie stars (most of them women) from Kathlyn Williams (Selig) to King Baggott (Imp), but she put together weekly Sunday columns, under the banner of “The Movies,” with capsule reviews of selected films featured in up to ten of the city’s theaters.⁴² Throughout December, she also arranged for the *News* to print a daily series of publicity photos from Kalem’s soon-to-be-released *From the Manger to the Cross*, which the paper suggested would “prove of permanent interest, especially to children.”⁴³ So successful was Price’s work for the *News* that, within three months, the *Register* was forced to introduce its own special column on the theater page of its Sunday edition, “At the Moving Picture Playhouses,” which also at first focused on the faces of “famous players” or “celebrities” sketchily depicted in rough line drawings.⁴⁴

Mapping the Local Terrains of Exhibition

For anyone seeking information on the vicissitudes of exhibition in New York City, the *Sunday Telegraph* simply is not the place to look. In the spring of 1911, for instance, several ads on the *Telegraph*’s Saturday “Vaudeville Review” page included the major theaters in the circuits of William Gane, William Fox, Frank Kenney, and Automatic Vaudeville. The following year, one small ad for Adolph Zukor’s Comedy Theatre (on Union Square) consistently listed its daily schedule of featured Independent films.⁴⁵ Otherwise, there was almost nothing.⁴⁶ The other newspapers, however, turn out to be valuable sources for addressing issues of local exhibition, especially when supplemented by city directories, other papers, and occasional notes in the trade press.

The *Sunday Leader*, for instance, offers a rather thorough listing of the major moving picture theaters in at least five of Cleveland’s commercial districts. Most of the more important theaters were downtown: The Mall, Princess, Bijou Dream, Avenue, Dreamland, Cameraphone, and Orpheum. Another half dozen – including the Superior (600 seats), Doan, and Home (600 seats) – were located in two districts along Superior and Lake streets on the northeast edge of the city.⁴⁷ Others were clustered in contiguous districts just south of that area, among them the Penn Square, U. S. Theater (1,600 seats), National, and Delmar (400 seats).⁴⁸ At least two, the Tabor and Broadway, helped anchor a fourth district along Broadway on the city’s southeast edge. Finally, another half dozen – among them the Park National, Fairyland, Cozy, and Clark (400 seats) – occupied two nearby areas in the southwest.⁴⁹ These theaters comprised no more than 25

percent of the total number in Cleveland, which, in 1911, came to approximately 120, but their ads in the *Leader* signaled a desire for status, or a status already achieved.⁵⁰ Further signs of that came from all those stories on local exhibitors, from an occasional report such as that on Penn Square (950 seats) – in the paper’s real estate and building construction page,⁵¹ and featured articles in the trade monthly, *Nickelodeon* – such as those for the National (700 seats) and Mission-style Dreamland (262 seats).⁵² Although the many residential theaters in Cleveland can only be located using city directories, at least several of those in the downtown commercial district – for instance, the Princess and Orpheum – clearly appealed to working-class audiences, for they also advertised in the labor weekly, the *Cleveland Citizen*.⁵³ Not unexpectedly, the *Leader* ignored the only theater with an all-black clientele, the Alpha, located on the city’s near east side – for those, one has to read the African-American weekly, the *Cleveland Gazette*.⁵⁴

Elsewhere in northeastern Ohio, the *Youngstown Vindicator* is perhaps an even better source of information on that city’s exhibition venues. Supplemented by city directories, the ads and columns in the *Vindicator* clearly indicate that all the sites of entertainment were located downtown, within a few blocks of the Central Square.⁵⁵ This obviously assumed a well-laid-out, efficient streetcar system that stretched into the city’s major residential areas and suburbs. Three vaudeville houses – the Grand Opera House, Park, and Princess – were clustered just south of the square. By the fall of 1911, a dozen moving picture theaters stretched out along six to eight blocks of Federal Street, half to the west of the square, the other half to the east. The most respected of these were on the west side, and advertised in the *Vindicator*: the Dome (owner-manager C. W. “Christy” Deibel), the Bijou (owner-manager Dan Robbins), the Orpheum (owner-manager Pierre Atselas), and the newly constructed Rex (owned by Harry Warner and David Robbins).⁵⁶ Those on the east side, some of which seemed to cater to the city’s Italian-born population, tended not to advertise.⁵⁷ A two-tier system of city permit fees restricted all moving picture theaters, however prestigious, to less than 200 seats, and only in the summer of 1912 would someone like Diebel be financially secure enough to risk constructing a new Dome Theater, with a seating capacity of nearly 1,000.⁵⁸ Although one or two nickelodeons may have existed beyond the downtown, it was not until then too that new theaters (like the Hazelton Dome) began to appear in residential areas.⁵⁹ Conditions were even more centralized in Canton, where all the theaters were located downtown. Despite an early *News* report that the city was “movie mad,” those theaters that advertised in the paper only programmed moving pictures exclusively on Sundays (when “blue laws” prohibited live performances) – that is, until the fall of 1912, when the Odeon finally shifted to pictures throughout the week.⁶⁰ It would be another half dozen years, however, before a moving picture theater opened in Canton’s residential areas.

In Iowa, conditions paralleled those in northeastern Ohio, but in surprising ways. As the smallest of all the cities under consideration, Cedar Rapids not unexpectedly had its one vaudeville house and several moving picture theaters all located in the downtown commercial district. According to the *Des Moines News* and city directories, however, Des Moines was more similar to Cleveland than Youngstown or Canton. Prior to 1911, moving picture theaters could be found in two commercial areas. The most important was the downtown shopping district (just north of the court house and passenger train station), the hub for a network of streetcar lines stretching into the city’s residential areas.⁶¹ There, the Colonial (owned by Charles Namur, who also was proprietor of a

leading downtown drugstore) and the Family (owner-manager Jacob Milowslowsky) were especially prominent, at least given their ads in the *News* as well as the *Register*.⁶² A second, smaller shopping district lay just below the State Capitol Building on the city's east side, where the Elite Theater, which also often advertised in the *News*, catered to (perhaps largely Scandinavian) white-collar and working-class audiences.⁶³ In late 1911, Namur began to open a series of residential theaters – the Idle Hour or University Place, near Drake University on the city's prosperous northwest side; the Highland Park, in a middle-class suburb north of the city; and Namur's South Side – all of which received notice in the *News*.⁶⁴ Several other small theaters also opened in residential areas on the east side. At the same time, downtown, theaters such as the 700-seat Unique (owned by Ben Elbert and John Getchel, who headed one of the city's amusement companies) shifted exclusively to moving pictures; others such as the Star (owner-manager A.H. Blank) were renovated; and still others were newly constructed – the 550-seat Casino (also owned by Blank), Golden, Royal, Palace, and Black Cat⁶⁵ – confirming a *News* editorial, in August 1912, that “the moving picture show is here to stay.”⁶⁶ By late 1913, there were close to twenty moving picture theaters operating in Des Moines, even more than in Youngstown, and they were much more widely dispersed.⁶⁷

Tracking the Diffusion of Moving Pictures I

The early 1910s were marked by several important changes in the American cinema industry, none of which occurred all that evenly or smoothly. The newspapers under consideration offer different perspectives on these changes, beginning with the intense competition between the MPPC and the Independents. The *Sunday Telegraph*, for one, took an active role in supporting the Independents as they struggled to create a nationwide system to distribute their films – which at first coalesced around the Motion Picture Distributing and Sales Company (or simply Sales) controlled by the Independent Motion Picture Company (Imp) and New York Motion Picture Company (Bison) – so as to compete with the more established MPPC companies and their new distribution outlet, General Film.⁶⁸ Ads for Edison, Lubin, Pathé, and Vitagraph initially outnumbered those of their rivals (Pathé probably even paid for stories named “Pathé Pointers”), and MPPC films often received more favorable reviews; yet, by 1911, the balance the paper was seeking to strike was evident in the weekly series of star player photographs, which alternated between those of MPPC and Independent companies. As the *Telegraph's* advocacy position became ever more apparent, the Independent manufacturers, whether associated with Sales or not, began to take out weekly ads – and more than a dozen were doing so by early 1912.⁶⁹ Yet the *Telegraph* carried little specific information on film distribution or exhibition. In 1911, it did inform exhibitors in or near New York City that new MPPC releases followed a regular circuit each day through the six Keith & Proctor theaters and that new Independent releases were shown daily at the Fourteenth Street Theater.⁷⁰ At the same time, that repeated ad for Zukor's Comedy Theatre may have served as a model program for the Independent films available each week from Sales.

The case was different with the *Sunday Leader*. Although also supportive of the Independents, what it did was to give advertising space to the major rental exchanges

that had offices in Cleveland – Feature & Educational Film, Lake Shore Film & Supply (eventually part of Mutual), Victor Film Service (eventually part of Universal), and Warner’s Feature Films – as well as General Film, in order for them to reach exhibitors throughout the region.⁷¹ Yet that support was less clear within the city itself, where most theaters’ ads did not signal their licensed or Independent status and where the lengthy columns describing individual theater programs initially included more with licensed than Independent titles. For instance, in the second week of January 1912, whereas specific licensed film titles were given for the Avenue, Park National, Superior, Home, Cedar, Cozy, and Cameraphone (in the latter, *Pathé’s Weekly* appeared each week, alternately, on Monday or Friday), Independent film titles were given only for the Princess, Mall, Tabor, and Doan (at least two of these explicitly appealed to working class audiences).⁷² By the end of 1912, however, now that Universal and Mutual were firmly established in the city, the ratio of licensed listings to Independent listings was nearly even. Whereas the *Leader’s* licensed theaters now included the Penn Square, Delmar, Dreamland, Broadway, Gordon Park, and Clark (most of those well established), its number of Independent theaters had swelled with the downtown Bijou Dream, National, Norwood, Gordon, and Isis – and at least one theater, the Cozy, had switched to the Independents.⁷³

The ads and columns in the *Youngstown Vindicator* suggest that the Independents at first were at an even greater disadvantage in that city. In the fall of 1911, General Film supplied the three major moving picture theaters – the Dome, Palace, and Orpheum – that advertised regularly in the paper, as well as two of the three vaudeville houses, the Grand and the Princess, for their “Sunday concerts.” At least in terms of newspaper advertising, Sales supplied only the Park. Moreover, for nearly six months, the most consistently promoted films were at the Princess: namely, “Essanay’s Great Western Thriller[s],” such as *The Stagedriver’s Daughter* or *Broncho Billy’s Christmas Dinner*, “with G. M. ‘Bullets’ Anderson in the cast,” sometimes with the added attraction of his photo.⁷⁴ This situation changed more slowly than in Cleveland. It seems to have begun with the Rex, newly constructed by Warner and Robbins and supplied with Independent films from Pittsburgh; and the Lyric and Bijou soon joined the new theater in advertising. Yet, after another new theater supplied by General Film, the Colonial, opened that winter, the Rex was taken over by Deibel to show “Dome pictures,” while the new Dome Theater was being constructed.⁷⁵ By the fall of 1912, the number of Independent theaters had doubled with the construction of the Star and the switch in service at the Colonial. But the licensed theaters also grew in number, with the renovation (and switch in service) of the Park and the appearance of the Hazelton Dome. Once the Rex abandoned licensed films in early 1913, the competition finally began to turn in favor of the Independents.⁷⁶ In Canton, conditions were more balanced. Whereas General Film supplied the Odeon and Orpheum, Sales supplied the Majestic, which advertised irregularly in the *News*, as well as the Grand Opera House. Both MPPC and Independent films seem to have circulated like clockwork through these venues, with *Pathé’s Weekly*, for instance, appearing on (and sometimes headlining) the Orpheum’s Sunday programs and then continuing during the week as one of several film reels shown during its regular vaudeville programs.⁷⁷

The Independents also seemed to be at a disadvantage in Des Moines, at least prior to Gertrude Price’s hiring at the *News* in late 1912. General Film supplied the Colonial, for years the most consistent theater advertiser in the paper, as well as others in Namur’s

chain of theaters – and the Colonial often made *Pathé's Weekly* the headlined feature of its Friday and Saturday programs.⁷⁸ It also supplied two other theaters that advertised infrequently, the Lyric and Star, as well as the Casino (after its construction in late 1912). As testimony to its initially weak position, Sales (and then Film Supply) serviced only the Family and Elite, at least of those theaters advertising in the *News*. Still, in the fall of 1911, the Elite made a special point of repeatedly promoting the “Famous ‘Imp’ Pictures [that were] rapidly making friends and steady patrons.”⁷⁹ At the same time, it bolstered those pictures and their fans by claiming that even “doctors, lawyers, bankers and their wives, [now] have the [moving picture] habit.”⁸⁰ Other theaters associated with the Independents the following year – the new Golden and the former vaudeville house, the Unique – advertised frequently in the *News*, but it was not until 1913, as in Youngstown, that they finally began to secure an advantageous position, when both Universal and Mutual had branches in the city.⁸¹ The situation in Cedar Rapids, by contrast, was just the opposite. By the fall of 1912, two major downtown theaters, the Palace and the Columbia advertised Independent films – the one supplied by Universal; the other, by Film Supply – indeed, the latter became an exclusive venue for Gaumont films, including *The Land of Lions*, repeated in November “by request.”⁸² The third theater, the Princess, only gradually revealed, in rather generic ads, that its films came from General Film.⁸³ Of all these cities, at least according to newspaper ads, only in the smallest did the Independents have a decided advantage as early as 1912.

Tracking the Diffusion of Moving Pictures II

A second important change in the industry came with the gradual introduction of multiple-reel films, especially as those reshaped and, in turn, were shaped by rental and exhibition practices. At first it may seem surprising that, even in early 1912, the majority of moving picture theaters that advertised in all of these newspapers offered programs in which the films changed daily. Yet, one has to remember that, by then, the MPPC and the Independents were releasing more than thirty film titles each per week.⁸⁴ In the *Sunday Telegraph*, for instance, Zukor's Comedy Theatre featured a different release from the Sales Company each day. In the *Sunday Leader*, the downtown Cameraphone and Avenue listed their schedule of daily licensed films, while the Mall and Tabor did likewise for their Independent films.⁸⁵ In the *Youngstown Vindicator*, the Dome, Palace, Orpheum, and Colonial all advertised a change of licensed films daily.⁸⁶ In the *Des Moines News*, both the Elite and Unique promised “fresh” Independent film titles each day; and, when the Casino opened later that same year, it too offered a new program of licensed films daily.⁸⁷ Des Moines ads, however, also reveal that almost as many moving picture theaters made less frequent changes in their films. The Family and Golden, both Independent theaters, changed their films three times a week, as did the Star, a licensed theater.⁸⁸ The Colonial alone offered bi-weekly programs of licensed films; yet all three of the other Namur theaters, in residential areas, advertised new films daily.⁸⁹ In short, the constantly changing variety package, once a mainstay of the nickelodeon period, still dominated exhibition, supported by the manufacturers' release schedules and by the “continuous shows” that many exhibitors continued to champion. The regularity of that variety package also allowed exhibitors to promote their more popular films, as some did with *Pathé Weekly*, for

instance, or as others did, in Cleveland, where the Orpheum had its “good Essanay” every Sunday, and the Cozy, its “Vitagraph night” every Thursday.⁹⁰

As two- and three-reel films moved beyond what the *New York Dramatic Mirror* called their “experimental” phase, in late 1911, exhibitors came up with different ways of working them into their highly structured programs.⁹¹ In Youngstown, both vaudeville houses and moving picture theaters used them as headliners on their Sunday programs. Special licensed films such as Kalem’s *Arrah-na-Pogue* or Selig’s *Cinderella* had top billing at the Dome – and *Cinderella* returned months later at the Princess – while “state rights” features such as *Camille* (starring Bernhardt) and *Mme Sans-Gêne* (starring Réjane) topped bills at the Orpheum.⁹² Yet, from November through March, it was the Park that promoted multiple-reel films most consistently, probably distributed by Feature & Educational Film in Cleveland – from Cines’ *The Crusaders* and Éclair’s *Zigomar* (also featured at the Rex) to Gaumont’s *Love and Aviation* and *The Rubber Trust*.⁹³ In Cleveland, some theaters also featured these longer films on Sundays, but just as many scheduled them regularly at other times during the week. In early January, for instance, *Cinderella* played at the downtown Avenue on Monday and Tuesday and then at the downtown Cameraphone on Sunday; two weeks later it was at the Home for a special Thursday showing; in February, it played first at the Cozy and then at the Superior, also on Monday and Tuesday.⁹⁴ That “masterpiece of sensationalism,” *Zigomar*, followed a similar trajectory through Independent theaters, playing on consecutive Sundays at the downtown Bijou Dream, Bronx, and Princess in December and early January, and later that month at the northeast-side Doan on Thursday and at the far-west-side Lakewood on Monday and Tuesday.⁹⁵ When 101-Bison’s spectacular “Indian pictures” became available in March, the downtown Mall showed *War on the Plains* on “Monday only,” while the Park National later opted for an unusual screening of *Battle of the Red Men* on Saturday.⁹⁶ In Des Moines, the special licensed features had even longer runs, partly because they so neatly fit the Colonial’s bi-weekly programs. In January, for instance, *Cinderella* played the first four days of one week, followed by Vitagraph’s *Vanity Fair* for three days the next week.⁹⁷ At the Family, special Independent features were shown for two days, on Mondays and Tuesdays, as were *Blazing the Trail* and *The Post Telegrapher*, when 101-Bison westerns finally became available in April.⁹⁸

By late 1912 and early 1913, whereas some exhibitors continued to bank on the profitability of the variety program, others were handling multiple-reel films even more regularly. In Youngstown, the new Dome now advertised its daily program of new films for the week.⁹⁹ Following the Park’s strategy of the year before, the Princess each Sunday ran a series of sensational features, most of them French crime thrillers – such as Gaumont’s *In the Grip of the Vampire* and *The White Glove Band*.¹⁰⁰ In Cleveland, more and more theaters were booking multiple-reel films, for one- to three-day runs. Some like the Broadway still restricted their extra headliners to Sunday, as in the case of Selig’s *The Coming of Columbus*, which reprised there in September after a unique four-day weekend run at the Cameraphone the previous May.¹⁰¹ They were joined by new theaters like the Norwood, on the city’s northeast side, which on Sundays often ran crime thrillers such as Eclair’s *Auto Bandits of Paris*.¹⁰² Yet many now booked features on week days, with licensed films circulating in a relatively regular pattern over the course of a month. Selig’s “animal picture,” *Kings of the Forest*, for instance, played first at the Delmar on Tuesday, then at the Penn Square two weeks later on Friday, and at the

Home and Clark another week later, on Sunday and Tuesday, respectively.¹⁰³ In Des Moines, a slightly different pattern emerged. The Casino opted for a daily variety format of new licensed films; by March 1913, it was advertising a weekly schedule every Sunday.¹⁰⁴ The Colonial continued its practice of bi-weekly program changes, but switched, in April, to special Independent features.¹⁰⁵ In January, the Unique began advertising a weekly schedule of Mutual films (changed daily), with Broncho features such as *The Burning Brand* on Wednesdays and the “celebrated Kay-Bee westerns” on Fridays.¹⁰⁶ In February, the new Theater Royal promised a two- or three-reel Universal feature each Tuesday through Thursday.¹⁰⁷ For its part, the Family booked Universal features such as *Sheridan’s Ride* on Tuesdays, which the Elite ran for eastside audiences a week later.¹⁰⁸

It was in 1912-1913, that even longer features began to have some impact, yet their circulation was anything but regular and their influence uneven. Here, the case of *Queen Elizabeth* (four reels) is especially telling. Its first appearance, surprisingly, came in Des Moines, not long after the initial release, where it played for one week at a legitimate theater, the Berchel, in mid-September.¹⁰⁹ Not until more than a month later did the film open in Cleveland, as the week’s sole feature attraction at another legitimate theater, the Colonial.¹¹⁰ Two weeks later, however, it turned up at the Superior on Sunday and Dreamland on Monday and Tuesday; a month later, it was the weekend headliner at a new eastside suburban theater, the Quincy.¹¹¹ In Youngstown, by contrast, *Queen Elizabeth* played at the Rex for just a single Sunday, in late November.¹¹² Similarly, in Canton, it played a special engagement at the Grand, but not until mid-February and only for two days.¹¹³ Perhaps not unexpectedly, the impact of *Queen Elizabeth* was most immediate in Cleveland. Another legitimate theater, the Duchess, roadshow Helen Gardner’s *Cleopatra* (five reels) for an exclusive two-week engagement in late December 1912.¹¹⁴ Within a month, other long films began to appear, but now as regular features, such as Blanche Walsh’s *Resurrection* (four reels) for two days at the U. S. Theater, or as week-long specials, such as Ambrosio’s *Satan* (four reels), the “sensation of two continents,” at the downtown Mall.¹¹⁵ In Youngstown, shortly thereafter, the Rex risked a screening (one of the first in the country) of Pathé’s *The Mysteries of Paris* (five reels), but again for just a single Sunday.¹¹⁶ In Des Moines, despite the return engagement of *Queen Elizabeth* at University Place for one weekday in February, no theater showed long features until May, when the Colonial finally began booking them regularly, starting with a week-long engagement of *Satan*.¹¹⁷ It was then too in Cedar Rapids, that a new theater, the Crystal, began extending its weekly Universal features with longer films such as Kalem’s *From the Manger to the Cross* (six reels).¹¹⁸

Promotion and Reception: Foreign Cracksmen, Western Heroes, and New Women

Whether exhibitors changed their programs of films daily or just two or three times a week, whether they kept to the reliable variety format of short films or risked booking longer “special features,” they still promoted their films in ways that did not always correspond to such differences. For those were determined not only by directives from the trade press, or even manufacturers, but by the interests and attitudes of the local newspaper in which they advertised as well as the kinds of stories that circulated through their pages – all of which made certain assumptions about their readers.

Here, again, the newspapers in northeastern Ohio and Iowa prove more valuable than does the *Morning Telegraph* in New York. Of all these papers, the *Leader* was most actively engaged in promoting moving pictures as a reputable form of entertainment, with audiences indistinguishable from those for the legitimate theater. Signs of this were persistent. In October 1911, for instance, a construction story boasted that “Cleveland Leads All Cities in Number of High Grade Photo-Play Places.”¹¹⁹ A year later, the top story on the *Photo Play News* page reported the continuing protest against using the slang term, “movies,” because “it harms the business.”¹²⁰ It was then too that the *Sunday Leader* flirted with offering a “Theatergoers” section that gave as much space to moving pictures as to the theater and the other arts.¹²¹ Soon after the paper introduced a special “Copperplate Pictorial Section” to its Sunday edition, in 1911, it twice reprinted star photos of a dozen “silent drama favorites” (all women); in early 1913, the section had a full page of publicity stills of Gardner, that “Sorceress of the Nile,” in *Cleopatra*.¹²² The *Vindicator*, much like the *Canton News*, simply accepted moving pictures as equal in status to vaudeville and stage drama (most of which was put on by local stock players or second-rate touring companies), but made little effort to give them extra promotion. One exception may be the brief allusion, in the late summer of 1912, to the theatrical “season of 1912-1913” as one that would be marked by moving picture “special releases.”¹²³ The *Des Moines News*, by contrast, was committed to promoting the new entertainment as “the biggest, most popular amusement” in a city that prided itself on a tradition of high-class music and theater.¹²⁴ Unlike the *Leader*, it happily seized on “The Movies” as the banner for its frequent photo-stories of stars, theater listings, and film reviews. By early 1913, the *News*’ “moving picture expert,” Gertrude Price, was already working as an industry reporter, sending back stories from New York and then Los Angeles on stars like Pickford, filmmakers like Alice Guy Blaché, and producers of “Wild West Pictures.”¹²⁵ Her “fans” in Des Moines clearly were not the same as Stoddard’s “fans” in Cleveland.

The pages devoted to photo plays or movies in these newspapers, however, also were framed by other stories, especially in the Sunday editions. In order to suggest how they contextualized the circulation and reception of moving pictures, let me selectively sift through those related to three different kinds of films – the first being the sensational crime thrillers from France. In April and May 1912, both the *Cleveland Leader* and the *Des Moines News*, along with other papers like the *San Francisco Chronicle*, carried major stories on the capture of the infamous Bonnot gang that had terrorized Paris and other nearby cities. Although the *News* was the first with its story, the *Leader* filled the first two pages of its “Cosmopolitan Section” with an extended account of the “Tiger Bandit” and his gang by Maurice Le Blanc, author of *Arsene Lupin*.¹²⁶ Previously, such sensational criminals were as often American as “foreign” – as in the full-page “Auto Cracksman” story published in the *New York Tribune*, in September 1911.¹²⁷ Thereafter, however, they tended to become fixed as French. This may explain, in part, the shifting and uneven reception of French crime thrillers during this period. *Zigomar*, for instance, was a smash hit in Cleveland, Youngstown, and Canton in the winter of 1911-1912, but it seems not to have been in Des Moines – perhaps because the film turned up only at the Elite, and *after* rather than *before* the Bonnot gang story.¹²⁸ Although French crime thrillers continued to circulate throughout 1912-1913, their success seemed limited, at least based on ads and stories. In Canton, the Auditorium celebrated its reopening, in November 1912, with Eclair’s *The Phantom Bandit* or *Zigomar*

II; in Youngstown, the Princess played one Eclair or Gaumont crime thriller after another from January through March 1913.¹²⁹ Yet in Cleveland, *The Phantom Bandit* played at only one downtown theater, the Princess (which advertised in the labor weekly, *Cleveland Citizen*), and at the Alpha, in the city's black ghetto.¹³⁰ Similarly, Eclair's *The Auto Bandits of Paris* played only at the Alpha and Norwood (another northeast side theater).¹³¹ In Des Moines, either these films never appeared or they simply were not advertised; yet in Cedar Rapids, they were major attractions during the summer of 1912 and again the following year.¹³² What this suggests is that, after the spring of 1912, the French crime thrillers may have played at theaters where (or on days when) the audiences were primarily working-class (Cleveland, Youngstown, Canton), and predominantly male, or African-American.

Other kinds of stories contextualized the sensational melodrama of the popular westerns in 1911-1912, but in rather different ways. In Cleveland, for instance, the Wild West now appeared often in a degraded form – in cartoons, comics, and certain graphic ads – and usually associated with young boys and play-acting.¹³³ In Des Moines, the Wild West still had some appeal, as was evident in the stories and ads promoting touring performances of the Miller Brothers' 101 Ranch Wild West.¹³⁴ This material, together with the general position of the papers, coincided with different westerns being featured in each of these cities. In Youngstown, for instance, "Bullets" Anderson apparently was so popular that, from the fall of 1911 through the spring of 1912, the Princess and then the Grand could make his Essanay westerns the headliners of their Sunday programs – and the same thing happened, though later, at the Orpheum in Canton.¹³⁵ In Cleveland, however, Anderson's westerns did not receive all that much attention until the fall of 1912; then the downtown Orpheum advertised its *Broncho Billy* series of films each Sunday, when the theater could draw its audiences from the working-class population of the city's east side – ads for the Orpheum also appeared regularly in the labor weekly, the *Cleveland Citizen*.¹³⁶ The westerns that were much more heavily promoted were the 101-Bison Indian pictures, culminating, in October 1912, with the much-delayed release of *Custer's Last Fight* (three reels) at the newly opened downtown Oxford Theater (opposite the May Company department store), "the only double-screen theater of its kind in the United States or Canada."¹³⁷ In Des Moines (and Cedar Rapids), neither "Bullets" Anderson nor *Broncho Billy* enjoyed much publicity. The 101-Bison westerns received some attention, yet those that did were not Indian pictures like *Battle of the Red Men*, lauded in Cleveland, but others like *Blazing the Trail*, with white settler heroes. Uniquely, Flying A westerns must have circulated widely enough, although never advertised by the Family, Elite, or Golden, because the company chose the *News*, along with fifty other newspapers across the country, to print a series of short stories, illustrated with stills, based on its soon-to-be-released films.¹³⁸

Finally, the many stories about the American "new woman" offered an even more revealing context for moving pictures and their fans in these cities. Not surprisingly, they did not appear frequently in either the Youngstown or Canton papers, and their relative absence threw into relief the masculine heroes and outlaws that took up the cities' screens and Sunday pages. A Grand ad, in Canton, for Mary Pickford in Biograph's *The New York Hat*, in early 1913, was a real anomaly.¹³⁹ The *Cleveland Leader*, by contrast, often heralded the "new woman" in articles on athletic figures, as in "A Modern Race of Amazons," in full-page ads for the Ohio Woman Suffrage Party, and in stories such as "The Stick-Up Girl: A True Story of an Uncaught Outlaw."¹⁴⁰ All framed the

paper's frequent photo stories of active women stars and their films – from Gene Gauntier or Mabel Normand to Pickford, when she joined Famous Players – and culminated, in late 1913, with the moving picture page becoming a regular feature of the Sunday Society Section, aimed at women readers.¹⁴¹ The *Des Moines News* was perhaps an even more insistent proponent of the “new woman.” Not only did it give front-page coverage to the suffragette march on Washington, in early 1913, but Gertrude Price joined the march to interview its leader, “General” Rosalie Gordon Jones.¹⁴² The summer before, the paper had printed stories about special screenings of suffragette films such as *Votes of Women* at the Unique; at the same time, its stories promoting performances of the 101 Ranch Wild West prominently featured the show's champion cowgirl riders and sharpshooters, Bessie Herberg and Lucile Parr, as much as its cowboys and Indians.¹⁴³ These created a supportive context for all the horsewomen and other clever, fearless “daredevils” in both licensed and Independent films, and especially westerns, that Price included among her many stories on stars – from Pauline Garfield Bush at Flying A or Mona Darkfeather at Universal to Beverly Bane at Essanay, Ruth Roland at Kalem, or Red Wing at Pathé. And Bush, she remarked with admiration was, much like herself, “an ardent suffraget.”¹⁴⁴

Conclusion

This essay has sought to take a multi-track approach to describing and analyzing the reciprocally profitable relationship that developed between newspapers and moving pictures in selected cities in the early 1910s. For the discursive traces of photoplays, players, and movies prove equally valuable whatever one's particular interest – from film distribution, exhibition venues, and programming formats to moving picture promotion and reception, especially as the latter were shaped by the cultural and political contexts of any one newspaper.

Distribution. The *Sunday Telegraph*, *Cleveland Leader*, and *Youngstown Vindicator* all suggest that the Independent companies had certain advantages from quite early on in their competition with the MPPC and General Film. As a trade weekly, the *Sunday Telegraph* nearly tipped the balance of power exerted by the trade press in favor of the Independents. The other two papers suggest how important several rental exchanges were to the increasing circulation of Independent films, including “features,” in the populous region of northeastern Ohio. In Iowa, by contrast, the *Des Moines News* and *Cedar Rapids Republican* suggest that only in a small city like Cedar Rapids did the least powerful of Independent distributors, Film Supply, enjoy a brief moment of dominance and that, even in a city like Des Moines, Universal and Mutual may not have achieved parity with General Film until late 1912 or early 1913.

Exhibition. Both the *Leader* and the *News* suggest how quickly the new moving picture theaters, noticed by Ellis Cohen in early 1910, spread into secondary shopping and entertainment districts as well as residential areas – and in very different cities. The *Vindicator* suggests how Sunday blue laws, coupled with entertainment licensing permits, offer evidence of key moments of prosperity for moving picture theaters in a city like Youngstown: by the summer of 1911, the Warner brother could return to their home town to erect the Rex; within another year, Deibel could build a New Dome Theater, the size and elegance of a legitimate theater. The *News* offers a parallel pattern

of key moments in Des Moines: Namur could open four residential theaters in 1911; Elbert and Getchel could switch the Unique to moving pictures exclusively in 1912; and Blank could begin moving into the new business by constructing the Casino by the end of that year – he would later become a regional executive for the Public Theaters controlled by Paramount.

Programming. The *Leader*, *Vindicator*, and *News* also all suggest how resilient was the variety format of daily-changed, one-reel films (whether or not supplemented by illustrated songs or vaudeville acts) first established in the nickelodeon period. The Odeon (Canton), New Dome (Youngstown), and new Casino (Des Moines) all maintained that format, even with the addition of two- and three-reel films, and apparently profitably, throughout 1913. At the same time, multiple-reel films and features – whether released by General Film or by a state rights Independent, and whether American or foreign – gradually gained a foothold in programs, especially in 1912, yet in different ways. In cities such as Youngstown, they initially tended to be state rights Independents restricted to single-day screenings on Sunday. In Cleveland and Des Moines, however, they were as likely to be General Film releases and run on regularly scheduled weekdays and often for two to four consecutive days. By the time longer features began to be roadshowed with some regularity in 1913, they were now as apt to appear in moving picture theaters as in legitimate theaters.

Promotion and reception. The *Leader*, *Vindicator*, and *News* finally are fascinatingly suggestive about how moving pictures were promoted and contextualized locally and for whom. They reveal that French crime thriller features quickly were seen as a staple for the presumably masculinized working-class (and immigrant?) audiences of Cleveland and Youngstown, and for those segregated racially. They reveal the enormous popularity, again for masculinized working-class audiences apparently, of Essanay westerns starring G. M. Anderson, who was first known as “Bullets” rather than Broncho Billy. They reveal the impact produced by the 101-Bison westerns, especially in Cleveland and Des Moines, not as sensational melodramas but as epic spectacles of equal value to more familiar literary adaptations. Perhaps most important, again especially in Cleveland and Des Moines, they reveal the highly visible presence of women in the new industry – from stars and actresses to writers, directors, and producers – as explicit, influential figures of the American “New Woman.” Moreover, through Gertrude Price, the *News* takes on special significance for the way it interconnects movies, professional women, and the suffragette movement for, once more presumably, female fans.

One kind of screen magic may have drawn newspapers and moving pictures together in the early 1910s; now another kind (even if less alluring) can help recover the palimpsest of shapes and patterns assumed by their mutual attraction.

The research for this essay was supported by a Faculty Research Grant from Drake University. It could not have been completed without the helpful assistance of the staffs of the following: the Periodical Room, Library of Congress; the Periodical, Literature, History, and Photography Departments, Cleveland Public Library (especially Evelyn Ward, Head of Literature); the Periodical Department, Stark County District Library; the Periodical Department, Ohio State Historical Library; the Periodical Department, Iowa Historical Society Library; the Interlibrary

Loan Services, Drake University Cowles Library; and my parents (Owen and Ruth Abel), brother (Ted), and sister-in-law (Deb) who graciously put up with me on a research trip to Cleveland, Youngstown, and Canton.

- 1 R. Abel, "'Don't Know Much About History,' or The (In)Vested Interests of Doing Cinema History," *Film History*, vol. VI, no. 1 (Spring 1994), pp. 110-115.
- 2 See, for instance, R. Abel, R. Altman (eds.), *The Sounds of Early Cinema* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2001 forthcoming).
- 3 See, for instance, R. Abel, "Frame Stories for Writing the History of French Silent Cinema," Symposium: *Writing the History of French Cinema*, UCLA, 12 May 2001.
- 4 Since writing this essay, I have discovered more information about the *Des Moines News* in relation to other newspapers; see R. Abel, "The Movies in a 'Not So Visible Place': Des Moines, Iowa, 1911-1914," in K. Fuller, G. Potamianos (eds.), *Beyond the Bowery* (forthcoming from University of California Press).
- 5 The only extant copy of the *Des Moines News* is at the Iowa Historical Society Library (Iowa City).
- 6 The quoted phrase is from D. Hulfish, "Motography: The Salesman," in *Motion-Picture Work* (New York: Arno Press, 1970 [1911/1915]), p. 112.
- 7 "The Movies," *Des Moines News* (12 November 1912), p. 1; "Many 'Dolor's Clubs' Named After This Beauty of the Movies," *Des Moines News* (12 November 1912), p. 8. "Supplement for Iowa," *Thirteenth Census of the United States, Taken in the Year 1910* (Washington, D. C.: Government Printing Office, 1913), p. 624. The 1910 census may not have been interested in distinguishing people according to class or income, but it did differentiate "native whites" and "foreign-born whites." Of Des Moines's 85,000 people, the census listed slightly more than 10,000 as "foreign-born white," with the greatest number coming from Scandinavia, Germany, and Russia (usually a code word at the time for Jewish). Like many Iowa cities, Des Moines was dominated by German-born immigrants, many second and third generation by 1910.
- 8 R. Stafford, "At the Moving Picture Show," *Youngstown Vindicator* (30 October 1910), p. 25. "Population-Ohio," *Thirteenth Census of the United States, III: Population Reports by States* (Washington, D. C.: Government Printing Office, 1913), p. 418. Of the 80,000 people in Youngstown, the 1910 census listed 25,000 as "foreign-born white," with the greatest number coming from Hungary (many of these Slovaks), Austria (many of these Czechs), and Italy.
- 9 The first of these columns appeared in the *Youngstown Vindicator* (3 September 1911), p. 17.
- 10 W. E. Sage, "The Triumphal Processioning of the Silent Players," *Cleveland Leader* (21 May 1911), Section M, p. 8. See also William E. Sage, "What Moving Pictures Mean to Regular Playhouses," *Cleveland Leader* (8 August 1911), Section M, p. 8. "Population-Ohio," *op. cit.*, p. 363, 398, 427-428. Of Cleveland's 500,000 people, the 1910 census listed nearly 200,000 as "foreign-born white," with the greatest number coming from Austria (many of these Czechs), Germany, Hungary (many of these Slovaks), Ireland, and Russia. These immigrant groups still had their own newspapers in 1912; see "American Spirit Predominates the Foreign Language Papers in Cleveland," *Cleveland Leader* (21 December 1912), Section M, p. 2.
- 11 See, for instance, "Photo-Plays and Players," *Cleveland Leader* (10 December 1911), Section S, p. 5. Stoddard, a former theater manager in Sandusky, Ohio, and now a *Leader* reporter, also edited one of the first daily newspaper pages devoted to real estate and building construction—see "Real Estate and Building News," *Cleveland Leader* (16 February 1913), Section M, p. 13; "Meet Your Plain Dealer Men About Town: Ralph Stoddard," *Cleveland Plain Dealer* (21 February 1948), Clipping File, Cleveland Public Library.
- 12 R. Grau, *The Theatre of Science* (New York: Benjamin Blom, 1969 [1914]), pp. 249-251.
- 13 The earliest example I have seen is E. Cohen, "In the Moving Picture Field," *Morning Telegraph* (2 January 1910), Section 4.1, p. 4. Grau claims that this page first appeared in January 1909, see Grau, *op. cit.*, p. 249.

- 14 "The Morning Telegraph and Motion Picture Enterprises," in "Motion Pictures and Photo-Plays," *Morning Telegraph* (5 March 1911), Section 4.1, p. 4. No one was named in this new department, but George Terwilliger is usually credited with initially heading the staff; see Grau, *op. cit.*, 250.
- 15 Important exceptions are the recent essays by Judith Thissen, Giorgio Bertellini, and Alison Griffiths and James Latham, respectively, on early Jewish immigrant, Italian immigrant, and African-American audiences in New York City; see M. Stokes, R. Maltby (eds.), *American Movie Audiences: From the Turn of the Century to the Early Sound Era* (London: British Film Institute, 1999), pp. 15-63.
- 16 Hulfish says much the same thing as late as 1911, in "Motion Picture Theater," *Motion-Picture Work*, p. 200. In a 8 May 1911 letter to the Selig Polyscope Company, however, J. D. Williams, a theater owner in Sydney, Australia, noted the lack of newspaper advertising by exhibitors in the USA as a serious problem for the industry as a whole—see Scrapbook #2 (p. 37) in the Charles G. Clarke Collection, Margaret Herrick Library, Beverley Hills, California. For certain exceptions, especially in the upper Midwest, see R. Abel, *The Red Rooster Scare: Making Cinema American* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1999) and R. Abel, "That Most American of Attractions, the Illustrated Song," in Abel, Altman (eds.), *op. cit.*, pp. 143-155.
- 17 M. Valentine, *The Show Starts on the Sidewalk: An Architectural History of the Movie Theatre* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1994), p. 31. For an early acknowledgement of the importance of the new "Moving Picture Theater," see E. Cohen, "In the Moving Picture Field," *Morning Telegraph* (23 January 1910), Section 4.1, p. 4. The best one-volume history of exhibition certainly skips this period between the nickelodeon and the palace or "national theater chains," see D. Gomery, *Shared Pleasures: A History of Movie Presentation in the United States* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1992). Although her chapter on exhibition supposedly focuses on "the newer 'palatial' theaters," Eileen Bowser does devote several informative pages to both nickelodeons and moving picture theaters after 1910; see E. Bowser, *The Transformation of Cinema, 1907-1915* (New York: Scribner's, 1990), pp. 121-136.
- 18 One of the best methodological models for this kind of historical analysis is W. Uricchio, R. Pearson, *Reframing Culture: The Case of the Vitagraph Quality Films* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993). I myself draw on this model in the last two chapters of *The Red Rooster Scare*, *cit.*
- 19 My research into newspaper coverage of moving pictures in the USA in the early 1910s is far from complete; so far I have begun to look at selected papers in three regions of the country that have gone relatively unexplored. Those include northeastern Ohio (where the Warner brothers originated), the upper Midwest from St. Louis through Iowa to Minneapolis (where I already had done some research for *The Red Rooster Scare*), and eastern Massachusetts (my work on the latter remains very preliminary). The *New York Telegraph* is considered here because it offered an early model for other newspapers in its coverage of moving pictures. For an earlier stage of this research, see my paper, "The Passing (Picture) Show in the Industrial Heartland: The Early 1910s," presented at the *Moving Images: Technologies, Transitions, Historiographies* Conference, Stockholm University, 3 December 2000.
- 20 "The Morning Telegraph and Moving Picture Enterprises," *Morning Telegraph* (5 March 1911), Section 4.1, p. 4. For a good summary of the "two journalisms" ("sensational" entertainment versus "objective" information) that developed in New York in the 1890s, see M. Schudson, *Discovering the News: A Social History of American Newspapers* (New York: Basic Books, 1978), pp. 88-120.
- 21 Grau, *op. cit.*, p. 251. *Comoedia*, a new specialized daily newspaper in Paris linked to the sporting magazine, *L'Auto*, may have provided a model for the *Morning Telegraph*: in January 1908, it added a weekly column of information on moving pictures to its coverage of current events and aesthetic issues in the arts (especially theater and music).
- 22 Eustace Hale Ball, an important scenario editor, suggested that, in order to determine "the needs and plans of companies," aspiring writers should consult professional trade magazines

- such as “the *Moving Picture World*, the *New York Sunday Telegraph*, *The Billboard*, *Motography*, the *New York Dramatic Mirror*, [and] the *Exhibitor’s Times-News*”; see E. H. Ball, *The Art of the Photoplay* (2nd ed.: New York: G. W. Dillingham, 1913), pp. 49-50.
- 23 Morning Telegraph ads, *Morning Telegraph* (26 March 1911), Section 4.1, p. 5, and (23 April 1911), Section 4.1, p. 6.
- 24 Grau, *op. cit.*, p. 251.
- 25 For an excellent study of this industrial “heartland,” including Cleveland and other cities in Ohio, see J. C. Teaford, *Cities of the Heartland: The Rise and Fall of the Industrial Midwest* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1993).
- 26 A brief history of the *Cleveland Leader* can be found at the beginning of the 1974 microfilm edition of the newspaper, prepared by the Ohio Historical Society, Columbus, Ohio. Unlike the *Leader*, the *Cleveland Plain Dealer* covered moving pictures very sporadically until 1914.
- 27 See, for instance, the editorials supporting Theodore Roosevelt for President, *Cleveland Leader* (5 November 1912), p. 6; and a half-page ad, “To Ohio Progressives,” *Cleveland Leader* (6 November 1912), p. 6.
- 28 Like many cities in the Midwest, Cleveland had a long tradition of cultivating the arts, especially music, because of its large German immigrant population; see Teaford, *Cities of the Heartland*, *cit.*, pp. 88-89.
- 29 See, for instance, “Free Admission to Select Circuit of Moving Picture Theaters,” *Cleveland Leader* (3 September 1911), Section N, p. 6. The *Leader* also took out full-page ads in other northern Ohio newspapers such as the *Canton News-Democrat* (17 April 1911), p. 3.
- 30 See, for instance, “Mandelbaum Sells Theaters,” *Cleveland Leader* (3 November 1912), Section W, p. 7; Samuel Bullock, “The Modern Moving Picture Theater,” *Cleveland Leader* (10 November 1912), Section B, p. 5; and “Some Big ‘Flickers’ in Picture Business,” *Cleveland Leader* (17 November 1912), Section B, p. 5. For more information on Mandelbaum, see “Film Supply Chain Links Six Cities,” *Cleveland Leader* (19 January 1913), Section M, p. 5; and “Uplifting the Feature Film,” *New York Dramatic Mirror* (19 November 1913), p. 30.
- 31 See, for instance, “Photo Plays and Players,” *Cleveland Leader* (3 December 1911), Section S, p. 5; and “Leader’s Gallery of Popular Photo Players,” *Cleveland Leader* (14 January 1912), Section S, p. 5, (21 January 1912), Section S, p. 6, and (28 January 1912), Section W, p. 8. Mary Pickford had been singled out even earlier, in “Moving Picture Star Tells of the Thrills of Her Art,” *Cleveland Leader* (22 October 1911), Section S, p. 5.
- 32 This description of Youngstown comes from a story in the *Youngstown Vindicator* (14 April 1907)- Clipping Files, Youngstown Public Library. The following summary of the *Vindicator’s* local concerns comes from those files as well.
- 33 “Population-Ohio,” *op. cit.*, p. 363, 418-419. Of Canton’s 50,000 people, the 1910 census listed slightly less than 10,000 as “foreign-born white,” with the greatest number coming from Germany, Hungary (many of these Slovaks), and Italy. The *Canton News-Democrat* changed its name to the *Canton News* in late November 1912. Canton’s other major newspaper, the *Repository*, much like the *Cleveland Plain Dealer*, also covered moving pictures only sporadically until 1914.
- 34 See the unsigned story about why so many people in Canton were “motion picture mad,” particularly “the working man and his family” for whom “theaters of this kind appeal[ed] most strongly—“Picture Show Poor Man’s Vacation Trip and Sure Cure for ‘Blues’ For All,” *Canton News-Democrat* (23 April 1911), p. 14. Unsigned columns describing and remarking on Sunday film programs at the downtown Odeon, Orpheum, and Grand Opera House also first appeared in the *Canton News-Democrat* in late September 1911; within a year, they were appearing (still unsigned) under a new banner, “Drama, Vaudeville, Photo Plays.”
- 35 “Today’s Entertainments,” *Youngstown Vindicator* (15 October 1911), p. 14. A similar story on Anderson appeared as “This Man’s Photo Seen Every Day by 300,000,” *Canton News-Democrat* (5 November 1911), p. 15. More than a month later, Anderson finally was noticed

- in Cleveland, in "Is Boys' Favorite G.-M. Anderson," *Cleveland Leader* (24 December 1911), Section B, p. 7.
- 36 "The Week in Moving Pictures," *Youngstown Vindicator* (11 August 1912), p. 16. In early 1913, this column was stressing the "educational" value of moving pictures by giving disproportionate attention, on Thursdays and Fridays, to all kinds of nonfiction films, especially travelogues.
- 37 C. W. Deibel, "50,000 Attend Youngstown Picture Shows Every Week," *Youngstown Vindicator* (27 April 1913), Magazine Section, p. 1.
- 38 See, for instance, "Des Moines: One of the World's Great Insurance Centers," *Des Moines News* (27 October 1910), p. 9.
- 39 What was "sensational" about the *Des Moines News* was its large, block headlines, extensive use of pictures, and attention to crime news, scandals, and disasters. The *New York Journal*, published by William Randolph Hearst, not only initiated such "sensationalism" but also coupled it with support for labor unions and the "common people;" see, for instance, D. Nasaw, *The Chief: The Life of William Randolph Hearst* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 2000), pp. 102-103, 169, 172. The *News* was especially interested in the Socialist Party's political triumph in Milwaukee, Wisconsin; see, for instance, D. Dale, "The Rule of the Socialists in Milwaukee and What They Are Doing," *Des Moines News* (21 July 1910), p. 4. Until 1902, the *News* was part of the Scripps-McRae chain of newspapers located in the Midwest; see F.L. Mott, *American Journalism: A History, 1690-1960* (3rd ed.: New York: Macmillan, 1962), p. 553.
- 40 See, for instance, the paper's boldly-bannered front-page coverage of the famous suffragette march on Washington for President Wilson's inauguration "Seven Thousand Women March Thru Washington," *Des Moines News* (3 March 1913), p. 1.
- 41 The only moving picture theaters to advertise in the *Register* were the Colonial and Family, and they did so irregularly throughout 1912. The two moving picture theaters – the Columbia and the Palace – that advertised in the *Cedar Rapids Republican*, beginning in the summer of 1912, did so several times a week. "Supplement for Iowa," 624. Of the more than 30,000 people in Cedar Rapids, the census listed slightly more than 5,000 as "foreign-born white," with the great majority coming from Austria (many of these Czechs).
- 42 See "Nervy as Ever to Act the Most Daring Things Ever Seen on the Stage!-Heroine of Movies," *Des Moines News* (17 November 1912), p. 7; and "King Baggot Detests Sentimental Stuff; Longs To Be Regular Dyed-in-the-Wool Rip Roarin' Joke," *Des Moines News* (7 December 1912), p. 2.
- 43 "Scenes from the Life of Christ: 1.-Mary as a Girl at Nazareth," *Des Moines News* (2 December 1912), p. 3. The series included nineteen publicity photos in all, concluding with "On the Way to Calvary," *Des Moines News* (22 December 1912), p. 12.
- 44 See, for instance, "At the Moving Picture Playhouses," *Des Moines Register and Leader* (9 February 1913), p. 7; and "Motion Picture Celebrities in the Public Eye," *Des Moines Register and Leader* (18 March 1913), p. 8.
- 45 See, for instance, the Comedy Theatre ad in the *Sunday Telegraph* (12 March 1911), Section 4.1, p. 4.
- 46 The *Telegraph* occasionally did print stories on exhibition, as in its brief report on the condition of the city's moving picture theaters, but not always about New York, as in its summary of moving picture theaters in Milwaukee "Conditions of Motion Picture Theatres in New York," *Sunday Telegraph* (26 March 1911), Section 4.1, p. 4; and "As It Is in Old Milwaukee, Wis.," *Sunday Telegraph* (10 April 1912), Section 4.2, p. 5.
- 47 The seating capacity for the Home and Superior come from "Some 'Flickers' in Picture Business," *Cleveland Leader* (17 November 1912), Section B, p. 5; and "'Superior' Rises From Small Start," *Cleveland Leader* (8 December 1912), Section B, p. 7.
- 48 The seating capacity for the Delmar comes from "Here Is Attractive Delmar Theater," *Cleveland Leader* (22 December 1912), Section S, p. 5; that for the U. S. Theater, from "New U. S. Theater Opens to Crowds," *Cleveland Leader* (10 March 1912), Section S, p. 6. See also "Among the Picture Theaters," *Motography* (April 1912), p. 189.

- 49 The seating capacity for the Clark comes from "Some Big 'Flickers' In Picture Business," *Cleveland Leader* (8 December 1912), Section B, p. 7.
- 50 See "Figure It Yourself," *Cleveland Leader* (21 January 1912), Section S, p. 6.
- 51 "Woodland to Have Fine New Theater," *Cleveland Leader* (3 September 1911), Section B, p. 4. The seating capacity of the Penn Square comes from "Penn Square Theater, Cleveland, Ohio," *Moving Picture World* (23 December 1911), pp. 998.
- 52 The seating capacities for the Dreamland and National, respectively, come from C. F. Morris, "A Picture Theater in the Mission Style," *Nickelodeon* (November 1909), pp. 137-138; and C. F. Morris, "The National Theater at Cleveland," *Nickelodeon* (December 1909), pp. 169-170.
- 53 See, for instance, the Orpheum ad, *Cleveland Citizen* (28 December 1912), p. 2; and the Princess ad, *Cleveland Citizen* (18 January 1913), p. 2. A block ad for a special Labor Day issue, in 1912, suggests that theaters in the northeast (Doan), east (Dixie, Glenside), and southeast (Market Square) commercial districts, and another on the city's far west edge (Lakewood, Madison), attracted working-class customers-see the *Cleveland Citizen* (31 August 1912), p. 12. The downtown Bronx also was included in this ad.
- 54 The Alpha Theater, 3206 Central Avenue, advertised almost weekly in the *Cleveland Gazette*, from July through December 1912.
- 55 For an extensive summary of Youngstown moving picture theaters, see E. Wheeler, "Youngstown, O.," *Moving Picture World* (25 November 1911), pp. 650-651.
- 56 According to city directories, several of Youngstown's initial moving picture men were in the liquor business: C. W. Deibel had been vice-president of Gallagher Company, a wholesaler in liquor and drugs; Dan Robbins had run a saloon on East Federal. It was Dan Robbins who, with the Warner brothers, opened a small vaudeville house and several nickelodeons under the name of Cascade Amusements in nearby New Castle, Pennsylvania, in 1907-see "South Mill Street Theater Will Soon Open the Season," *New Castle Herald* (8 November 1907), n.p.; "Cascade Theater to be Formally Opened to Public Tonight," *New Castle Herald* (19 November 1907), p. 1; and the Cascade ads, *New Castle Herald* (16 September 1908), p. 4. When the Warners returned to Youngstown, after developing a profitable rental exchange, Duquesne Amusement & Supply (in Pittsburgh), Harry Warner built the downtown Rex Theater with David Robbins, who had run the Robbins family grocery business on the western edge of the city.
- 57 The moving picture theaters on East Federal were named Columbus, Luna, Luxor, Napoli, and Roma.
- 58 See Wheeler, *op. cit.*, p. 650; the photo-story on the reconstruction of the Dome theater in the *Youngstown Vindicator* (7 July 1912), p. 7; and the full-page ad for the opening of the New Dome Theatre in the *Youngstown Vindicator* (22 December 1912), p. 24. The seating capacity for the New Dome comes from this ad.
- 59 See the Hazelton Dome Theater ad, *Youngstown Vindicator* (18 August 1912), p. 17. This theater also was owned in part by Deibel.
- 60 See, for instance, the daily listings in Odeon ads in the *Canton-News-Democrat* (20 October 1912), p. 13, (8 November 1912), p. 6, and (17 November 1912), p. 13. The Grand also switched to moving pictures exclusively for a time in early 1913; see the Grand ad, *Canton News* (29 December 1912), p. 11.
- 61 The city's major street car company built a summer amusement park, Ingersoll Park, at one terminus on the western edge of the city; its vaudeville theater showed moving pictures as early as 1902, and one street car line allowed eastside working-class residents direct access to it, without changing cars downtown.
- 62 Namur's drugstore was still "the most popular" in the city in 1914-see the large Namur's ad, *Des Moines News* (30 June 1914), p. 3. Miloslosky rarely called attention to his ownership of the Family, but see J. Miloslosky, "Family Reopens," *Des Moines Register and Leader* (24 July 1913), p. 3.

- 63 The immigrant backgrounds of the city's neighborhoods can be gathered from the churches listed in the *Des Moines City Directory* (Des Moines: R. I. Polk, 1908), pp. 53-57. The churches that still held services in Swedish or Norwegian as well as English were located on the east side of Des Moines.
- 64 See, for instance, the Idle Hour University Place Theatre ad, *Des Moines News* (12 September 1911), p. 8; Namur's (Highland Park) Theatre ad, *Des Moines News* (15 November 1911), p. 6; "Photo Plays," *Des Moines News* (18 February 1912), p. 6; and Namur's block ad, *Des Moines News* (18 November 1912), p. 6.
- 65 See "Elbert & Getchel to Make Changes at Unique-Majestic," *Des Moines News* (30 April 1911), p. 6; "Photo Plays," *Des Moines News* (27 January 1912), p. 3; the Casino ad, *Des Moines Register and Leader* (4 December 1912), p. 4; the Theatre Royal ad, *Des Moines News* (2 February 1913), p. 6; the Large Casino ad, *Des Moines News* (16 March 1913), p. 6; "Star Theatre Sold," *Des Moines News* (9 May 1913), p. 4; "New Palace is Beautiful Theater," *Des Moines News* (26 October 1913), p. 6; and "Black Cat Movie House," *Des Moines News* (2 November 1913), p. 2. The seating capacities for the Unique and Casino come, respectively, from the Unique ad, *Des Moines News* (26 January 1913), p. 6; and the Casino ad, *Des Moines News* (16 March 1913), p. 6.
- 66 "Moving Pictures," *Des Moines News* (20 August 1912), p. 4. For some sense of the prosperity of moving picture theaters in Des Moines, especially those of A. H. Blank, see "Local Men Find Movie Shows Are Paying Ventures," *Des Moines News* (23 October 1913), p. 2.
- 67 Unlike in Cleveland, Des Moines's African-American population was not large enough to have a moving picture theater of its own; in fact, theaters were segregated, as was revealed in the case in which a "negro justice of the peace of Bussey, Iowa" unsuccessfully sued the manager of the Royal Theater "Movie Man Freed in Color Case," *Des Moines News* (27 June 1913), p. 4.
- 68 See, for instance, the extensive analysis of the Independent companies in Ellis Cohen, "In the Moving Picture Field," *Morning Telegraph* (2 January 1910), Section 4.1, p. 4. The founding of the Sales Company followed close on the heels of the incorporation of the General Film Company (the distributing arm of the MPPC) and the bankruptcy of the Film Import & Trading Company; see Cohen, "In the Moving Picture Field," *Morning Telegraph* (20 February 1910), Section 4.1, p. 4, (20 March 1910), Section 4.1, p. 4, and (3 April 1910), Section 4.1, p. 4.
- 69 By 1912, those independent manufacturers included Thanhouser, Nestor, American, Solax, Champion, Éclair, Imp, Majestic, Gaumont, Great Northern, Reliance, and Republic. The only MPPC manufacturers were Lubin, Essanay, and Pathé (but for *Pathé's Weekly*). The Sales Company was prominently advertised, but not the General Film Company.
- 70 See, for instance, "Licensed Film Releases" and "Independent Film Releases," *Morning Telegraph* (5 March 1911), Section 4.1, p. 5.
- 71 See, for instance, the F. & E. Film, Lake Shore Film & Supply, Victor Film Service, and General Film ads, *Cleveland Leader* (31 December 1911), Section B, p. 7. In the spring of 1912, the Sales Company broke up into three companies: Film Supply (which advertised briefly in the *Leader* that fall and turned out to be the least powerful), Universal, and eventually Mutual. The first Warner's Feature Film ad appeared in the *Cleveland Leader* (2 March 1913), Section M, p. 11.
- 72 "Photo-Plays and Players," *Cleveland Leader* (7 January 1912), Section S, p. 7. Ads for *Pathé's Weekly*, listing from six to ten new subjects each week, began to appear in the *Cleveland Leader* (28 January 1912), Section W, p. 8. See also "Boosting a Pathé Film," *Cleveland Leader* (28 January 1912), Section W, p. 8.
- 73 "Big Holiday Bills at Local Theaters," *Cleveland Leader* (22 December 1912), Section S, p. 5.
- 74 See the Princess ads, *Youngstown Vindicator* (15 October 1911), p. 15, (19 November 1911), p. 18, and (24 December 1911), p. 16.
- 75 See the Rex ads, *Youngstown Vindicator* (21 April 1912), p. 21, and (23 June 1912), p. 18.
- 76 See "Rex Changes Hands: Manager Remains," *Youngstown Vindicator* (19 January 1913), p. 21; and the Rex ad, *Youngstown Vindicator* (26 January 1913), p. 19.

- 77 See, for instance, the Orpheum ad, *Canton News-Democrat* (19 November 1911), p. 16, p. 17.
- 78 See, for instance, the Colonial ads, *Des Moines News* (30 April 1912), p. 7, and (14 May 1912), p. 2.
- 79 See the Elite ads, *Des Moines News* (6 August 1911), p. 6, (3 September 1911), p. 6, and (10 September 1911), p. 6.
- 80 See the Elite ad, *Des Moines News* (24 September 1911), p. 6.
- 81 Laemmle Film Service, which would become part of Universal in late spring 1912, had a branch in Des Moines by 1911; see the Sales ad, *Moving Picture World* (5 August 1911), p. 260. Mutual opened its branch office a year later-see the Mutual ad, *Moving Picture World* (17 August 1912), p. 611.
- 82 See, for instance, the Palace ad for Universal's *The Massacre of the Sante Fe Trail*, *Cedar Rapids Republican* (5 October 1912), p. 3; and the Columbia ads for Gaumont's *The Land of Lions*, *Cedar Rapids Republican* (31 October 1912), p. 3, and (3 November 1912), p. 3.
- 83 Again, one of the features consistently advertised was *Pathé's Weekly*-see the Princess ads, *Cedar Rapids Republican* (30 October 1912), p. 3, and (20 November 1912), p. 3.
- 84 See, for instance, "Spectator's' Comments," *New York Dramatic Mirror* (31 January 1912), p. 51. For a thorough overview of the initial introduction of American two- and three-reel films, especially in terms of production and distribution, and from the standpoint of the trade press, see Bowser, *op. cit.*, pp. 191-204.
- 85 See, for instance, the Cameraphone, Avenue, and Tabor ads, *Cleveland Leader* (7 January 1912), Section B, p. 7; and the Mall ad (24 March 1912), Section S, p. 6.
- 86 Each Sunday "The Week in Moving Pictures" column in the *Youngstown Vindicator* described and remarked on from one to four new films each day shown at the Dome, Palace, and Orpheum; occasionally each theater would mention its change of films daily.
- 87 See, for instance, the Unique ad, *Des Moines News* (18 January 1912), p. 8; the Elite ad, *Des Moines News* (28 January 1912), p. 6; and the Casino ad, *Des Moines Register and Leader* (4 December 1912), p. 4.
- 88 See "Photo Plays," *Des Moines News* (31 January 1912), p. 8; the Family ads, *Des Moines News* (19 April 1912), p. 14, and (21 April 1912), p. 6; and the Star ad, *Des Moines Register and Leader* (21 April 1912), p. 5.
- 89 See "Photo Plays," *Des Moines News* (18 February 1912), p. 6.
- 90 The Cozy listed its "Vitagraph night" in "At Leading Theaters," *Cleveland Leader* (14 January 1912), Section S, p. 5. The Orpheum began advertising its Essanay westerns every Sunday in the *Cleveland Leader* (10 November 1912), Section B, p. 5.
- 91 See "Spectator's' Comments," *New York Dramatic Mirror* (8 November 1911), p. 26. The argument that many theaters had only one projector (which mandated a break, an illustrated song, or a vaudeville act between reels) seems far from tenable. In Youngstown, for instance, in late 1911, the Dome was using three projectors; the Orpheum, Palace, and Bijou all used two; see Wheeler, *op. cit.*, p. 650. At the same time in Canton, the Odeon boasted of its two Edison projectors-see the Odeon ad, *Canton News-Democrat* (29 October 1911), p. 10. Information on the number of projectors used in theaters in Cleveland is more difficult to come by, but if the small downtown Crescent (300 seats), with its two projectors, is any indication, a two-projector system must have been relatively standard in commercial district theaters by 1911; see C. F. Morris, "A Cleveland Fireproof Theater," *Nickelodeon* (15 April 1910), pp. 197-198. In Des Moines, the Casino used at least two "Powers machines"-see the Casino ad, *Des Moines Register and Leader* (4 December 1912), p. 4. Although never mentioned, the Colonial probably used two projectors because it consistently stressed its "continuous" programs and, in early 1911, could afford to install the only "Plate Glass Mirror Screen outside of New York and Chicago"; see the Colonial ad, *Des Moines News* (17 January 1911), p. 3. Notably, however, the Family Theater did not add a second projector until the summer of 1913; "Family Reopens," *Des Moines Register and Leader* (24 July 1913), p. 3.

- 92 See the Dome ads, *Youngstown Vindicator* (10 December 1911), p. 21, and (7 January 1912), p. 16; the Princess ad, *Youngstown Vindicator* (31 March 1912), p. 20; and the Orpheum ads, *Youngstown Vindicator* (12 May 1912), p. 18, and (19 May 1912), p. 21.
- 93 See the Park ads, *Youngstown Vindicator*, from 5 November 1911, p. 17, to 31 March 1912, p. 20.
- 94 Just prior to the film's release, the *Leader* also printed a special photo-story on Mabel Taliaferro who starred in *Cinderella*-see "Famous Actress in Film," *Cleveland Leader* (17 December 1911), Section S, p. 7.
- 95 Feature & Educational Film ads promoted *Zigomar* in the *Cleveland Leader* from January 14 to February 4. The company also may have paid for the photo-story on this "great detective film" appearing in the *Cleveland Leader* (4 February 1912), Section S, p. 6.
- 96 The company or its distributor, Film Supply, may have paid for the photo-story on 101-Bison's *The Crisis* which, in conjunction with Film d'Art's *Camille* (with Sarah Bernhardt) and Biograph's *The Girl and Her Trust*, appeared in the *Cleveland Leader* (7 April 1912), Section S, p. 8.
- 97 See the Colonial ads, *Des Moines News* (3 January 1912), p. 5, and (11 January 1912), p. 6.
- 98 See the Family ads, *Des Moines News* (21 April 1912), p. 6, and (5 May 1912), p. 6.
- 99 See, for instance, the Dome Theatre ad, *Youngstown Vindicator* (23 February 1913), p. 17.
- 100 See, for instance, the Princess ads, *Youngstown Vindicator* (16 February 1913), p. 18 (16 March 1913), p. 21.
- 101 See the Cameraphone ad, *Cleveland Leader* (5 May 1912), Section W, p. 8; and the Broadway ad, *Cleveland Leader* (15 September 1912), Section W, p. 7. In June, *The Coming of Columbus* not only played at two theaters in Canton but was promoted with a full-page article on the film's production and story-see the Odeon ad, *Canton News-Democrat* (2 June 1912), p. 16; the Orpheum ad, *Canton News-Democrat* (16 June 1912), p. 12; and "Wonderful Moving Pictures," *Canton News-Democrat* (16 June 1912), n. p. The Orpheum even sponsored a contest inviting school children to write essays on *The Coming of Columbus*-see the Orpheum ad, *Canton News-Democrat* (26 May 1912), p. 14. This promotion may have been designed to counter the influence of the Italian "Black Hand" gang in Canton, a city which, by the 1920s, would gain some notoriety as a Mafia stronghold and later be branded the "Little Chicago" of Ohio. Always known for its "muckraking" tendencies, the *News* would win a 1927 Pulitzer Prize "for [editor] D. R. Mellet's campaign against the city's underworld that cost him his life;" A. McClung Lee, *The Daily Newspaper in America: The Evolution of a Social Instrument* (New York: Macmillan, 1937), p. 646.
- 102 See the Norwood ad, *Cleveland Leader* (17 November 1912), Section B, p. 5. Appearing with *The Auto Bandits of Paris* was another Éclair crime thriller, *The Mystery of the Notre Dame Bridge* (three reels).
- 103 See "Genuine African Jungle," *Cleveland Leader* (10 November 1912), Section B, p. 5; the Delmar ad, *Cleveland Leader* (17 November 1912), Section B, p. 5; the Penn Square ad, *Cleveland Leader* (1 December 1912), Section B, p. 5; and "Coming Events at Local Theaters," *Cleveland Leader* (8 December 1912), Section B, p. 7.
- 104 See "The Movies," *Des Moines News* (16 March 1913), p. 6.
- 105 See the Colonial ad, *Des Moines News* (20 March 1913), p. 8.
- 106 See the Unique ads, *Des Moines News* (21 January 1913), p. 5 (26 January 1913), p. 6.
- 107 See the Theatre Royal ad, *Des Moines News* (2 February 1913), p. 6.
- 108 See the Family ad, *Des Moines News* (27 January 1913), p. 6.
- 109 *Queen Elizabeth* first played at Powers Theatre in Chicago, in the middle of August-see the Famous Players ad, *Moving Picture World* (17 August 1912), p. 679. See the Berchel ad, *Des Moines News* (14 September 1912), p. 5.
- 110 See "Preliminary Peeps at the Peep Shows" and the Colonial ad, *Cleveland Leader* (27 October 1912), Section M, p. 3, 4.

- 111 See the Superior and Dreamland ads, *Cleveland Leader* (10 November 1912), B5; and the Quincy ad, *Cleveland Leader* (15 December 1912), Section S, p. 5.
- 112 See the Rex ad, *Youngstown Vindicator* (24 November 1912), p. 26.
- 113 See the Grand ad, *Canton News* (February 1913),
- 114 See the Duchess ad, *Cleveland Leader* (22 December 1912), Section M, p. 5.
- 115 See the U. S. Theatre ad, *Cleveland Leader* (2 February 1913), Section B, p. 4; and the Mall ad, *Cleveland Leader* (23 February 1913), Section M, p. 11.
- 116 See the Rex ad, *Youngstown Vindicator* (23 February 1913), p. 20.
- 117 See "The Movies," *Des Moines News* (4 February 1913), p. 6; and "Great Demand to See Satan," *Des Moines News* (8 May 1913), p. 8.
- 118 See the Crystal ad, *Cedar Rapids Republican* (7 May 1913), p. 3.
- 119 See "East End To Have Two New Theaters," *Cleveland Leader* (22 October 1911), Section M, p. 5.
- 120 See "Protest Against Use of Name, 'Movie'," *Cleveland Leader* (20 October 1912), Section S, p. 5.
- 121 See the special "Theatergoers Section," *Cleveland Leader* (29 December 1912) and (5 January 1913).
- 122 See "Film Fairies: Stars of the Stilly Screen," *Cleveland Leader* (21 May 1911), Copperplate Pictorial Section, p. 3; "Reproducing on Paper Faces Seen by Thousands on Screen," *Cleveland Leader* (11 June 1911), Copperplate Pictorial Section, p. 3; and "Santa Claus' Stationary Portraits of Moving Picture Stars," *Cleveland Leader* (24 December 1911), Copperplate Pictorial Section, p. 3. The *Leader* was among the first newspapers to apply the fotogravure process to printing special picture pages; see Lee, *op. cit.*, pp. 128.
- 123 See "The Week in Moving Pictures," *Youngstown Vindicator* (28 July 1912), p. 17.
- 124 The *Des Moines Mail and Times*, a weekly aimed at women, and the *Des Moines Register and Leader* both gave special attention to the musical and theatrical events that defined the city's high culture.
- 125 See, for instance, Price, "Stunning Mary Pickford – Only 19 Now – Quits \$10,000 'Movies' Career to Shake Her Golden Locks as a Belasco Star," *Des Moines News* (9 January 1913), p. 7; Price, "Daily News Reporter Writes From Great California Studios Where They Make Your Wild West Pictures," *Des Moines News* (1 February 1913), p. 6; and Price, "Charming Little Woman Runs 'Movie' Business By Herself and Makes Big Success," *Des Moines News* (9 February 1913), p. 2.
- 126 See "Auto Bandits Terrorize Paris, Rivaling Exploits of Most Notorious Westerners," *Des Moines News* (13 April 1912), p. 4; and Mauric Le Blanc, "Bonnot, Tiger Bandit," *Cleveland Leader* (5 May 1912), Section C, pp. 1-2. See also "The Phantom Bandits: Paris, Ever the Home of the Unusual, Furnishes the World Its Very First Automobile Ghost Story," *San Francisco Chronicle* (21 April 1912), Sunday Magazine, p. 2.
- 127 See "The Auto Cracksman Loots - Sometimes Slays - and Is Off Like a Flash," *New York Sunday Tribune* (3 September 1911), Section 2, p. 1.
- 128 See "Zigomar a Great Success," *Cleveland Leader* (17 December 1911), Section S, p. 7; the Rex and Park ads, *Youngstown Vindicator* (31 December 1911), p. 16 (7 January 1912), p. 17; the Auditorium ad, *Canton Repository* (25 February 1912), p. 15; and the Elite ad, *Des Moines News* (18 April 1912), p. 7.
- 129 See the Auditorium ad, *Canton News-Democrat* (10 November 1912), p. 17; and the Princess ads for largely French crime thrillers, *Youngstown Vindicator*, from 19 January 1913, p. 20, to 23 March 1913, p. 24.
- 130 See the Princess ad, *Cleveland Leader* (18 August 1912), Section W, p. 5; and the Alpha ad, *Cleveland Gazette* (14 September 1912), p. 3.
- 131 See the Alpha ad, *Cleveland Gazette* (19 October 1912), p. 3; and the Norwood ad, *Cleveland Leader* (17 November 1912), Section B, p. 5.

- 132 See the Palace ad for *Zigomar II*, *Cedar Rapids Republican* (4 July 1912), p. 3; the Columbia ads for Gaumont and Éclair crime thrillers, *Cedar Rapids Republican* (24 July 1912), p. 3, (28 July 1912), p. 3 (8 September 1912), p. 3 (15 September 1912), p. 3; and the Crystal ads for *Zigomar III* and *Fantomas*, *Cedar Republican* (30 August 1913), p. 3 (7 September 1913), p. 3.
- 133 See, for instance, the editorial cartoon, *Cleveland Leader* (25 June 1911), p. 1; the ads for home moving picture machines and play suits, *Cleveland Leader* (22 September 1911), Sunday Magazine back cover; and the “Tenderfoot Tim” comic strip, *Cleveland Leader* (27 November 1912), Comic Weekly, p. 3.
- 134 See, for instance “Summer Amusements” and the 101 Ranch Wild West ad, *Des Moines News* (28 July 1912), p. 12. See also the Colonial ad for Selig’s three-reel *Diamond ‘S’ Ranch*, *Des Moines News* (21 March 1912), p. 8.
- 135 See, for instance, the Orpheum ad, *Canton News-Democrat* (28 April 1912), p. 14; and “Orpheum Theater,” *Canton News-Democrat* (9 June 1912), p. 12.
- 136 See, for instance, “Anderson at the Orpheum,” *Cleveland Leader* (10 November 1912), Section B, p. 5.
- 137 See “New Theater Has A Double Screen” and “Custer Film at Oxford,” *Cleveland Leader* (13 October 1912), Section W, p. 8.
- 138 See, for instance, “The Grub Stake Mortgage - A Moving Picture Short Story of Western Life,” *Des Moines News* (17 January 1912), p. 10; “Where Broadway Meets the Mountains - A Moving Picture Short Story of the West,” *Des Moines News* (27 January 1912), p. 3; and the American Film ads in *Moving Picture News* (9 March 1912), p. 51, and *Moving Picture World* (16 March 1912), pp. 980-981.
- 139 See the Grand Opera House ad, *Canton News-Democrat* (15 January 1913), p. 4.
- 140 See, for instance, “A Modern Race of Amazons,” *Cleveland Leader* (6 August 1911), Section C, p. 1; Woman Suffrage Party, “Her Job,” *Cleveland Leader* (1 September 1912), Section M, p. 4; and T. B., “The Stick-Up Girl: The True Story of an Uncaught Outlaw,” *Cleveland Leader* (16 March 1913), Feature Section, p. 1.
- 141 See, for instance, “Gene Gauntier as Girl Spy in New Warner Feature Film,” *Cleveland Leader* (9 March 1913), Section M, p. 5; “Mary Pickford Again To Play Before Camera,” *Cleveland Leader* (1 June 1913), Section C, p. 4; and “Amusements and Places of Entertainment,” *Cleveland Leader* (16 November 1913), Section S, p. 10.
- 142 See Gertrude Price, “A Day With General Jones and Her Army of ‘Hikers’ on Their Way to the Capitol,” *Des Moines News* (23 February 1913), p. 3.
- 143 See “Suffragettes See Parade Picture,” *Des Moines News* (25 June 1912), p. 5; “Votes For Women in Picture Play,” *Des Moines News* (27 June 1912), p. 5; “Daring Girl Rider Coming,” *Des Moines News* (27 July 1912), p. 3; and “Summer Amusements,” *Des Moines News* (28 July 1912), p. 12.
- 144 See Price, “The Great Spirit Took Mona, But in This Girl She Lives,” *Des Moines News* (6 February 1913), p. 12; Price, “Western Girl You Love in the ‘Movies’ is a Sure Enough Suffrager,” *Des Moines News* (11 February 1913), p. 3; Price, “Movie Girl in Social Whirl Is Artist-Horsewoman-Wit,” *Des Moines News* (8 April 1913), p. 4; Price, “Runs, Rides, Rows,” *Des Moines News* (16 April 1913), p. 6; and Price, “Picturesque Indian Maid Is Fearless-Ambitious-Clever!” *Des Moines News* (27 April 1913), p. 4.