ECHOES OF PARADISE: ANALYSING 21ST CENTURY RENDERINGS OF SOUND IN PARADISO 30

Amy Harris, *Joshua Brown*, *Anna Gadd*[1]

The complexity of *La Divina Commedia* for both Italian and international audiences alike is well documented, how «his own country had never understood him, so that it would be impossible for a foreigner to penetrate such darkness» (Goethe *et al.*, 1883: 100). As impossible as it is to believe, given Dante's explosion in popularity in recent years, there was a distinct «dearth of Dantean images during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries» as the Poet briefly fell into obscurity (Dukes). Goethe attributed «the cause of his obscurity» to «the difficult rhyme» (ivi).

The sound of Dante's poetry presents a special difficulty for translators, as it is the first poetry to take the form of terza rima. Terza rima is a hendecasyllable verse form in which the first and third lines rhyme with each other as well as the second line of the previous tercet (Longenbach, 2007: 52). For English translators in particular, maintaining perfect terza rima throughout is an almost unsurmountable task, given that English is a «rhyme-starved» language in which «the same rhyme sound keeps cropping up too early» (James, 2013: xiv). However, this impenetrableness has not stopped 21st century translators from taking on the task of rendering terza rima into English, with thirty-seven translators producing at least one canticle of *La Divina Commedia* in English between 2000 and 2023. This study will focus on how translators have rendered the specific rhythm and rhyme patterns in English editions.

This study builds upon a previous analysis of meaning by Amy Harris utilising the same corpus of translations selected for their variety in approaches to rendering *La Divina Commedia* into English. Criteria considered when selecting the corpus include Englishes, country and nationality, macro and micro choices, and paratexts, and canticle/canto, resulting in the following five editions for the corpus:

1. *The Divine Comedy* translated by Robin Kirkpatrick (2012), for its representation of Dante translated into poetic British English in blank verse.
2. *The Divine Comedy* translated by Burton Raffel (2010), as an example Dante translated into American English in imperfect terza rima.
3. *The Divine Comedy* translated by Clive James (2013), a translation in regular rhyming quatrains. James is also the only Australian to translate Dante, after having lived in the UK for many years.
4. *Paradiso* translated by Stanley Lombardo (2017), a translation into «American poetic vernacular» that «preserve(s)» the «tercet structure and the rhythmic integrity of each line» (p. xxx); and
5. *Paradise, Dante's Divine Trilogy Part Three, Englished in Prosaic Verse* by Alasdair Gray (2020), which represents British English dialect and his unique approach to meaning and sound, demonstrated by the subtitle, *Englished in Prosaic Verse*.

[1] The University of Western Australia.

In this study, features of rhythm and rhyme are considered in relation to the form chosen by the translator along with their paratextual reasoning for their choices. The translations examined may vary greatly in terms of rhythm and rhyme, as long as a rationale for the macro choices is provided.

A translator must sacrifice some aspect of a text for the sake of realising another (Longenbach, 2007: 52). When translating a source text such as a literary poem in which musicality and meaning hold equal importance, the target text ought to «unite sound and meaning» (Cavagnoli, 2003: 77). In other words, given that the source text was conceived in such a way that the sound is an essential part of and therefore inseparable from the meaning, the translation ought to do the same. However, when this is not possible, the translator must "make a choice" between the two (Cavagnoli, 2003: 77). In the case of translating a rich literary poem such as *La Divina Commedia*, a translator ought to make a macro choice whether to highlight the meaning, the sound, or both. This study considers translations which have made some attempt at highlighting either the sound alone or both meaning and sound. 'Sound' shall refer to elements that are the building blocks of Dante's terza rima: rhythm and rhyme.

In the instance of *La Divina Commedia*, the particular type of rhythm is the hendecasyllable, that is, a line of verse containing eleven syllables. Conventions associated with the hendecasyllable include:

1. *synaloepha*, referring to the joining of the final vowel of a word and the first vowel of the following word, such as *selva oscura*, which is read aloud as *sel-vaos-cu-ra* (*Inferno* 1, Line 2);
2. *elision*, referring to the suppression of a vowel, such as *tant'è*;
3. *synizesis*, referring to the contraction of two vowels into a single syllable, such as *Dio*;
4. *diaeresis*, referring to the separation of a diphthong (two vowels in a single syllable) into two vowels, such as *ïo* (*Paradiso* 31, Lines 31-40);
5. *stress* in terms of the hendecasyllable, in which stressed syllables can be arranged in various patterns. The tenth syllable of the verse is always stressed. When the line ends with a stressed syllable (which must be a vowel), the hendecasyllable contains only ten syllables (Scott, 2004: 263).

In the 14,233 lines of *La Divina Commedia,* there are 753 rhymes present (Scott, 2004: 269). Dante employs various categories of rhyme:

a) *rime piane*, or feminine rhymes, which are accented on the penultimate syllable. The vast majority of rhymes in *La Divina Commedia* are *rime piane*;
b) *rime sdrucciole*, or triple rhymes, are accented on the antepenultimate syllable;
c) *rime tronche*, or masculine rhymes, are accented on the final syllable;
d) *rime composte* are rhymes which are made up of two or three words. This also includes *rima derivativa* in which rhyming words have the same stem;
e) *rime identiche* are rhymes on the same word, which is extremely rare;
f) *rime equivoche* are homographs (words that are spelled the same but have different meanings);
g) *rime ricche*, in which the initial consonants of the stressed syllables are identical; and
h) *rimas caras*, a Provençal term meaning "difficult" rhymes (Scott, 2004: 270-271).

The «aural dimension» of *La Divina Commedia* is an essential aspect of the text, given Dante's «first audiences» were likely listening to the poem rather than reading it[2] (Kleinhenz, 2013: 288). Every translator addresses the question of sound in their translator's note. Kirkpatrick (2012: XLII) states that «the physical patternings of metre, rhythm and rhyme […] demand close attention from the translator». He clarifies his macro choice not to «rely upon end-rhyme», but rather to «reproduce of the aural density of the original by a consistent use of internal rhyme, assonance and alliterative patterning»[3] (xlv). Kirkpatrick also chooses to «abandon all attempts at rhyme»[4] (XLV).

Raffel (2010: XI) explains his macro choice of imperfect terza rima by stating his position that *La Divina Commedia* seems «to depend more on its lyric flow than on its perfect rhyming»[5]. He goes on to explain how his macro choice is to «evoke the poetic aspects» of Dante's Italian[6] (ivi: XI-XII). In other words, it would appear Raffel considers the sound as paramount in translation. Finally, he describes using enjambment more often in his translation than the source text to achieve the effect of Dante's «flowing Italianate lyricism»[7] in English (ivi: XIII).

An important macro choice of James' is to create a rhyming translation, either simple or augmented rhyming quatrains[8]. In his translator's note, he upholds the necessity of a translation to rhyme given that «in the original, some of the meaning was in the sound» (James, 2013: xiv). He also chooses to «avoid feminine rhymes», instead employing the «strong, solid dignity» of masculine rhymes «to match Dante's gravitas» (James, 2013: XVI). However, feminine rhymes, or *rime piane*, are the most common rhymes in the poem (Scott, 1977: 269). This is an example of the essential differences between rhymes in Italian and English and the inevitable «source loss and translating gain»[9] that occurs

[2] «We are generally accustomed to reading texts silently, but in doing so we overlook the crucial aural dimension of the poem, of which Dante was acutely aware. Indeed, his first audiences were probably composed more of 'hearers' than of 'readers', and hence the importance of the spoken text to our appreciation of the *Comedy*» (Kleinhenz, 2013: 288).

[3] «Conscious of such possible distortions, the translation offered here does not usually rely upon end rhyme, though at times - when a particularly conclusive effect is called for - it will produce such a rhyme. This translation has, however, been written in the conviction that the body of Dante's text is indeed of central significance. It seeks therefore to reproduce something of the aural density of the original by a consistent use of internal rhyme, assonance and alliterative patterning, seeking also, in this respect, to create a discernible phonetic design and simultaneously to replicate those effects of paragraphing and narrative orchestration which are central to Dante's enterprise» (Kirkpatrick, 2012: XLV).

[4] «Some translations (such as the present) have abandoned all attempts at rhyme, tending to justify the departure by maintaining that Italian has an unfair advantage over English» (Kirkpatrick, 2012: XLIV). Kirkpatrick goes on to further denounce translations that rhyme: «All too often rhyme becomes the dominant point of interest in a line, drawing undue attention to itself and often distorting the subtleties of cadence or inflection and thrust of Dante's narrative. At worst - and the worst often happens - an obsession with regular rhyme can distract translator and reader alike from the precise implications of Dante's meaning, which is itself almost invariably precise» (ivi: XLV).

[5] «There are exact and technical equivalents in Dante's style to both mind and body, and to the 'harmonies and ligatures' that ensure a fully psychosomatic interaction. Grammar and syntax have their part to play in this, as do the physical patternings of metre, rhythm and rhyme. And all of these features demand close attention from the translator» (Kirkpatrick, 2012: XLII).

[6] «That is, I have sought to evoke the poetic aspects of the Italian, but not to attempt the utterly impossible task of replicating Dante's Italian» (Raffel, 2010: XI-XII).

[7] «Enjambment is occasionally employed in the *Commedia*; it occurs a good deal more often in the translation, since this manipulation of syntax is what poets in our language must rely upon, to achieve anything like Dante's flowing Italianate lyricism» (Raffel, 2010: XIII).

[8] «The form is a quatrain, either simple or augmented, and any augmentations use the same rhymes, so abab might grow to ababa or ababab or sometimes more» (James, 2013: XXII).

[9] «I am arguing that a ratio of source loss and translating gain cannot be avoided or resolved, and the only way that a translation can do right abroad, in relation to the source text and culture, is to do wrong at home» (Venuti, 2013: 246).

between sound systems of different languages (Venuti, 2013: 246). While James commits to rhyming throughout, Lombardo (2017: XXX) describes in his translator's note that he has «opted to use rhyme where (he) think(s) it counts the most». He also makes the macro choice to preserve «the tercet structure and rhythmic integrity of each line»[10] (ivi). To achieve this, he will be «varying his line lengths from nine to twelve syllables»[11] (ivi). Finally, Gray's macro choice in terms of sound for his 'prosaic verse' translation is to use «end-rhymes where they came easily, internal rhymes where they did not»[12] (Gray, 2019: 6). We can also presume his translation will sound "abrupt", given his north-British dialect (*ibidem*). However, he is not explicit in how these macro choices will manifest on the micro level.

Table 1. *Selected loci from Paradiso 30 and rationale for analysis*

Locus	**Italian**	**English (my translation)[13]**	**Rationale (taken from Scott or Verdicchio)**
Locus 1 (ll. 1 – 3)	*Forse semilia miglia di lontano / ci ferve l'ora sesta, e questo mondo / china già l'ombra quasi al letto piano*	Maybe six thousand miles away / the sixth hour burns, and this world / inclines already its shadow almost to a level bed	This complex description of the placement of the sun and the shadows cast by the earth sets the tone for the rest of the canto, the rhythm and rhyme demonstrating the beauty of «the coming dawn» (Verdicchio, 2010: 162).
Locus 2 (ll. 14 – 15)	*per che tornar con li occhi a Beatrice / nulla vedere e amor mi costrinse*	turning my eyes to Beatrice / nothing to see and love compelling me	Scott (1977: 161) argues it is impossible to translate the nuances of this line into English. For example, the «*nulla vedere e amor* are so much part of a single thought that they receive a verb in the singular *mi costrinse* (instead of *mi costrinsero*), while they stress the fact that these are external forces acting on the pilgrim: nothing to be seen, the spectacle is without as well as within».
Locus 3 (ll. 28 – 29)	*Dal primo giorno ch'i' vidi il suo viso / in questa vita, infino a questa vista*	From the first day I saw her face / in this life, up until this sight	These lines are significant for their sound effects, especially the alliteration of *vidi, visto, vita,* and *vista*, which Scott (2077: 163) argues is «impossible to reproduce» in English.
Locus 4 (ll. 40 – 42)	*luce intelletüal, piena d'amore; / amor di vero ben, pien di letizia; / letizia che trascender ogne dolzore*	Intellectual light, full of love / love of true good, full of joy / joy that transcends every sweetness	Scott (2077: 163) argues that these three lines alone give «the essence of paradise». The phrase *'luce intelletüal'* «illumines man's spirit and the angelic intelligences» and is «characteristic of the poetic tone of the final cantos» (Scott, 1977: 164).

[10] «Just as important as rhyme in the dynamics of Dante's verse is the tercet structure and the rhythmic integrity of each line, both of which I work to preserve in translation» (Lombardo, 2017: XXX).

[11] «Dante's eleven-syllable line tends to have three accentual beats with several relatively un-stressed syllables between each beat and one or more word-ending vowels elided – features that I have incorporated into my verse line, although I have allowed the lines to vary in length from nine to twelve syllables» (Lombardo, 2017: XXX).

[12] «In English end-rhymes are harder so most translators get them with language seldom used in daily speech. My version mainly keeps the Dantean form colloquial by using end-rhymes where they came easily, internal rhymes where they did not» (Gray, 2019: 6).

[13] The English translations provided are my own, insofar as they are careful approximations of the other original translations that make up the corpus of this thesis. The purpose of my translations is to provide the reader a word-for-word comparison between the Italian and English, which was similar to the purpose of Lombardo's.

Locus 5 (ll. 82 – 86)	*Non è fantin che sì sùbito rua / col volto verso il latte, se si svegli / molto tardato da l'usanza sua / come fec' io, per far migliori spegli / ancor de li occhi, chindandomi a l'onda*	No infant so thrust its face upon its milk, having wakened far later than its usual feeding time, as did I, making better mirrors of my eyes, bending down to the wave	In Dante's world, a reference to «vision through mirrors, *per specula*,» is «the second stage in the mystic's ascent towards God, where the third and final stage was the vision in *speculo*, in the mirror of the godhead» (Scott, 1977: 168). Here Dante's desire is «to know and understand what he sees», a desire which is comparable to a baby yearning for milk (Verdicchio, 2010: 163).

(Adapted from Amy Harris)

This study will analyse each translators' approach to sound in terms of macro and micro choices. Each associated paratext addresses some aspect of sound and the question of its replication or evocation in their translator's note. All translators pay close attention to the various aspects of rhythm and rhyme, with James being the only translator to make the macro choice of maintaining a regular rhyme scheme. While the translators' notes all vary in terms of length and detail, each translator has provided justification for their micro choices which are analysed in detail below.

***

Locus 1 (ll. 1 – 3)

In the source text, imperfect rhyme can be observed in the repetition of sound in the adjacent words *se**milia*** and ***miglia***, while rime piane in *lont**ano*** and *pi**ano*** ties lines 1 and 3 together. Each of the three lines is eleven syllables long, characteristic of terza rima, and enjambment allows each line to flow easily into the next.

While in the source text the first three lines of *Paradiso* flow easily into one another via enjambment and a consistent hendecasyllable, these aspects manifest differently in each translation. In Kirkpatrick's, he sticks to iambic pentameter, as informed by his initial macro choice. This creates a prestigious effect, placing the text within the English literary tradition alongside the long list of canonical poets who have used iambic pentameter[14] (Blakesley, 2021: 378). Unlike the source text in which enjambment is used to create a run-on effect between each of the three lines, Kirkpatrick's use of a comma at the end of line 1 creates a slight pause before line 2, and a full stop at the end of line 3 creates a strong pause which sonically closes off the would-be *terzina* from the rest of the canto: "*Maybe, around six thousand miles away, / the sixth hour, close to noon, flares out, while earth / inclines its shadow-cone to rest, near level*".

Raffel follows through with his macro choice of employing enjambment, with the exception of the end of line 3: "*Perhaps six thousand miles away, the sixth / Hour is glowing, and in this world of ours / The shadow's sloping down to the far horizon*," (p. 494). Indeed, Raffel's micro choices are comparable to Lombardo's: "*Some six thousand miles away the noon hour / perhaps burns bright, and already our world here / inclines its shadow almost to a level bed*" (p. 293). Both translators vary their line lengths between ten and eleven syllables. While losing the rhyme of the source text, Raffel and Lombardo compensate by evoking its rhythm and enjambment.

A quite different take on rhythm and enjambment is James' translation, as he ends the first line with a full stop. He then adds another full stop in line 2, sonically splitting it in

[14] «Blank verse, used by both Shakespeare and Milton, was the prestigious poetic form par excellence in England from the mid-sixteenth century to the mid-twentieth century and was felt to be the ideal substitute for the distinguished Italian poetic metre» (Blakesley, 2021: 378).

half: "*Six thousand long miles eastward it is noon. / Here, night is ending. The Earth's shadow lies*". These almost dramatic pauses slow the poem down, opposite to the flowy effect of the source text's rhythm. Instead, James employs internal near rhyme to compensate for this loss (***miles*** and ***lies***) and begins his rhyme scheme for the canto.

James and Gray are the only translators who use end rhyme, specifically masculine rhymes, in their translations. James' macro choice of rendering Dante into rhyming quatrains informs his micro choice to connect lines 1 and 3 with rhyme: "*Six thousand long miles eastward it is n**oon**. / … Level in bed, and in the mid-sky, s**oon**,*" (p. 505). James' establishment of a consistent rhyme scheme in these opening lines successfully creates the forward pull for the reader that exists in the source text. A similar effect can be observed in Gray's translation of lines 2 and 3: "*cast its steep cone of shadows to the h**eight** / where constellations gleamed throughout the n**ight***" (p. 119). The end of line 4 is also made to rhyme with the beginning of line 5: "*shining in the **east** / in**creased***". Despite Gray's translator's note asserting his macro choice of translating Dante into prosaic verse, these opening lines of Gray's *Paradiso* 30 are instantly recognisable as poetry, furthered by the enjambment that carries Gray's description of the setting for five lines: "*The sun behind the world's vast curvature / cast its steep cone of shadow to the h**eight** / where constellations gleamed throughout the n**ight** / until a faint dawn, shining in the **east** / incr**eased**, tilted the shadow to the west*" (p. 119). Both James and Gray's micro choices regarding rhyme in these first few lines compensate for the loss of terza rima.

Sound in lines 1 to 3 manifests slightly differently for each translation, according to the macro choices of each translator. Kirkpatrick employs iambic pentameter and punctuates line 1, while Raffel and Lombardo recreate the enjambment, matching the source text's rhythm more closely. James employs dramatic pauses through punctuation but compensates for the loss of the source text's rhythm and flow by applying regular rhyme. Both James and Gray use masculine end rhyme, sonically connecting the lines. While this micro choice adheres to James' macro choice of maintaining rhyming quatrains, it contradicts Gray's macro choice to render Dante into 'prosaic verse'. The opening lines of each translation of *Paradiso 30* indicate how each translator has navigated terza rima differently.

***

Locus 2 (ll. 14 – 15)

The source text contains assonance of the shortened '*e*' vowel: "*per ch**e** tornar con li occhi a Bëatric**e**[15] / nulla v**ed**er**e e** amor mi costrins**e***". Synaloepha joins the final vowel of *vedere* with the *e* that follows. The act of reading these lines aloud with the repeated *e* vowel continually pulls the corners of one's mouth into a near smile.

Each translation produces a wide variety of sound effects. Kirkpatrick (p. 463) initially remains faithful to the iambic pentameter form characteristic of blank verse: "*And so, from seeing nothing – and in love –*". He then switches to iambic tetrameter for the following line, "*I turned my eyes towards Beatrice*", ending the phrase with a full stop (p. 463). Line 14 contains five iambs, while line 15 contains four, fostering a sonic build-up of speed. This culminates in the final two-syllable proper noun *Beatrice*[16], with stress falling on the latter syllable. The full stop that directly follows creates finality and emphasis. Kirkpatrick appears to actively choose to avoid rhymes even when other translators, as we will see,

[15] Differences in pronunciation between Italian and English immediately cause the loss of the sound effects created by Beatrice's name, including the repeated shortened '*e*' vowel.
[16] As it is pronounced in English.

create rhymes that sound natural in English. These micro choices reflect Kirkpatrick's macro choice to «abandon all attempts at rhyme» (Kirkpatrick, 2012: XLIV).

Where Raffel loses the perfect terza rima, he compensates by adding internal rhymes, such as his repetition of the elongated *e* vowel: "*So there was nothing to s**ee**, and love obliged m**e***" (p. 494). Indeed, this choice of vowel creates a similar effect to that of the source text when read aloud, pulling the corners of one's mouth outwards. The following line, "*To turn and see my Beatrice, forever br**ight***", creates end-rhyme with line 13: "*And bit by bit shut away from my s**ight***" (p. 494). This rhyme repeats twice more: in line 17, *sl**ight***, and line 19 again with the word *s**ight***. These micro choices add up to compensate well for the loss of perfect terza rima.

James' translation, like Kirkpatrick's, follows iambic pentameter. However, unlike Kirkpatrick who drops the iambic pentameter in the second instance, James (p. 505) maintains it through to the following line: "*Retreated from my sight, so, being blind / And full of love, there was no help for it*". We can also observe sibilance in the adjacent words ***s**ight*, ***s**o*, followed by the alliteration of the voiced bilabial plosive, ***b**eing* ***b**lind*. The result is a sonically cohesive pair of lines. Lombardo's translation (p. 293), "*so that **my** seeing nothing and **my** love / constrained **my** eyes to turn back to Beatrice*", utilises the combination of iambic pentameter and repetition to create poetic flow and prestige.

Of all the translations, Gray's is the most prosaic: "*so dazzling that, apart from Beatrice, / I could not see a thing*" (p. 119). This micro choice reflects his macro choice to keep «the Dantean form colloquial» (Gray, 2019: 6). Perhaps to compensate for the loss of iambic pentameter and rhyme, Gray chooses the unusual double *z* consonant, creating a sound effect that stands out and draws attention to the pair of lines: *da**zz**ling*.

Different translations of lines 14 and 15 exhibit various sound effects, according to the initial macro choices of each translator. Kirkpatrick manipulates the metre to create sonic build up and emphasis. Raffel echoes the rhyme of source text through his use of internal rhymes and end rhymes. James employs iambic pentameter and introduces sibilance and alliteration to direct the reader's attention, while Lombardo's translation utilises iambic pentameter and repetition to create prestige. Gray's translation, prosaic to match his macro choice, uses sibilance to create emphasis. Overall, each translator compensates differently for the loss of the source text's assonance, synaloepha, and hendecasyllable.

***

Locus 3 (ll. 28 – 29)

Elision can be observed in *ch'i*, in which the *e* of *che* and the *o* of *io* are suppressed. Enjambment is employed, creating a natural flow between the two lines: "*il suo viso / in questa vita*". Line 29 also contains parallelism with two consecutive phrases that contain a similar grammatical structure, separated by a caesura, marked most notably by the repetition of the word *questa*: "*in questa vita*, *infino a questa vista"*. This gives the lines a musical balance.

No translation recreates Dante's exact alliteration of the voiced fricative (***v**idi* -***v**isto*-***v**ita*-***v**ista*), a loss which was quite inevitable[17] given the lack of common words in English beginning with a *v* that also have corresponding meaning in Italian. This demonstrates the dilemma translators face when they are forced to choose between meaning and sound. In

[17] «Translators, then, can never entirely avoid the loss that the translation process enforces on the source text, on its meanings and structures, figures and traditions. And translators cannot obviate the gain in their translating, the construction of different meanings, structures, figures, and traditions and thereby the creation of textual effects that go far beyond the establishment of a lexicographical equivalence to signify primarily in the terms of the translating language and culture» (Venuti, 2013: 37).

this case, the translators, ultimately choosing to render the meaning, each apply various poetic effects to compensate for the loss of original sound.

Most translators incorporate sibilance as well as the alliteration of the *f* consonant. Kirkpatrick's micro choices to pack these two lines with sibilance and alliteration achieve the aural density mentioned in his translator's note: "***s**ince… **f**irst li**f**e, / **f**irst **s**aw… **f**ace… thi**s**… **s**ight*," (p. 464). Raffel does the same, while also being the only translator to apply a voiced fricative with the use of the word '**v**ery' to maintain an echo of the source text: "*thi**s** li**f**e… **s**aw… /Fa**c**e… **v**ery **f**irst*". James, asserting in his translator's note that the meaning and sound are inextricably linked, makes comparable micro choices to Kirkpatrick: "***f**rom… **f**irst… **s**ee / fa**c**e in li**f**e… thi**s**…*" (p. 506). Lombardo's translation applies similar effects: "***F**rom… **f**irst… **s**aw… fa**c**e… / thi**s** li**f**e, … thi**s**…*" (p. 295). While all translators understand the inevitability of the loss of the source text's alliteration, each of their target texts produces natural poetic sound effects, "compensat(ing) for an irreparable loss by controlling an exorbitant gain"[18] (Venuti, 2013: 110).

All translators incorporate rhyme into their renderings of lines 28 and 29. Despite Kirkpatrick's initial macro choice to abandon rhyme altogether, he makes use of near rhyme in lines 28 and line 29, both at the midway point and the end of each line. This creates a rhythmical, bouncy effect: "*Not since the d**ay** that I, in our first l**i**fe, / first saw her f**a**ce until this living s**igh**t*" (p. 464). Observe the *a* vowel in *d**ay*** and *f**a**ce*, and the repeated elongated *i* vowel in *l**i**fe*, and *s**igh**t*. Since the rest of Kirkpatrick's translation does not contain much rhyme, these two lines stand out. Raffel repeats the elongated '*i*' vowel across lines 28 and 29: *l**i**fe*, ***I***, and *t**i**me*. He also makes use of a polyptoton: ***day*** and *to**day***. Because Raffel's near-rhymes are not in parallel positions, they are less obvious and do not sound as bouncy as Kirkpatrick's: "*In this l**i**fe, and on the **day** I saw her / F**a**ce the very first t**i**me, and until to**day***" (p. 495). The same can be said of James' subtle near-rhyme: ***I***, *l**i**fe*, *f**a**ce*, and *ag**ai**n*. Lombardo's use of rhyme also remains subdued: *d**ay***; ***I***; *f**a**ce*; and *l**i**fe*. Gray only repeats the elongated 'a' vowel, rendering his translation the most prosaic, as per his macro choice: "From the first d**ay** that I saw her f**a**ce / in this life, until this vision of her now" (*Paradise* 119).

In the source text, line 28 spills over into line 29 with enjambment. Kirkpatrick, on the other hand, chooses to remove the enjambment, instead adding a comma: "in our first life, / first saw" (464). This instructs the reader to slow down. While the source text's flow is lost, a pleasant, leisurely pause is gained. Raffel however maintains the enjambment: "on the day I saw her / Face the very first time" (495). Lombardo does the same: "I saw her face / in this life" (295). As such Raffel's and Lombardo's translations maintain a rhythm closer to the source text, which reflects their macro choices. Throughout *Paradiso* 30, James alternates between heavy use of pause and ongoing enjambment. Here, James' enjambment creates the constant onward flow described in his translator's note[19], as if the reader is rushing towards Beatrice: *"…came to see / Her face in life to this incredible / Moment…*" (506).

Each translator, in different ways, compensates for the difficult sound effects of the source text, employing features such as alliteration, parallelism, and near rhyme. No translator recreated the alliteration of the voiced fricative, apart from Raffel, whose use of the 'v' consonant serves as a reference or echo to the sound which is so prevalent in

[18] «To read a translation as a translation, as a text in its own right, we need a more practical sense of what a translator does. I would describe it as an attempt to compensate for an irreparable loss by controlling an exorbitant gain» (Venuti, 2013: 110).

[19] «The aim is an easy-seeming onward flow, except at the end of the canto, where a couplet closes the action with a snap. In every other formal aspect, the layout is established by Dante himself» (James, 2013: XXII).

the source text. In Kirkpatrick's translation, the addition of a pause draws attention and emphasis to the lines. On the other hand, Raffel and Lombardo maintain the enjambment, contributing to the poetic flow of their respective target texts, while James extensively applies it to create a rushing effect. All translators repeat certain vowels or consonants, even Gray, whose translation is the most prosaic.

***

Locus 4 (ll. 40 – 42)

Lines 40 and 42 are tied together with rime piane of the words *am**ore*** and *dolz**ore***. The word *luce*, which begins line 40, is a repetition of the end of line 39. The words *piena*, *amore*, and *letizia* are also all repeated once, creating parallelism: "*luce intelletüal, piena d'amore*; / *amor di vero ben, pien di letizia*; / *letizia che trascender ogne dolzore*".

Most translators recreate the repetition of the target text. In Kirkpatrick's translation, he repeats *light*, *all*, *love* and *happiness*: "*to **light**, pure **light** of intellect, **all love** / the **love** of good in truth, **all happiness**, / a **happiness** transcending every rapture*" (p. 464). The alliteration of *l* in ***l**ight, pure **l**ight of inte**ll**ect, a**ll** **l**ove, / the **l**ove*, as well as word-internal harmonization in *intellect*, achieves Kirkpatrick's macro choice of recreating the aural density of the body of the source text (p. 464). The second word of lines 40 and 41, *all*, recreates the source text's parallelism. Raffel, by translating *piena di* first as *full of* and then as *filled with*, loses the repetition of the source text. He also chooses not to repeat *joy*, instead only repeating *love*: "*In the heavens, a thinking brightness, full of **love** - / The **love** of truthful goodness, filled with a joy / Transcending any and every kind of sweetness*" (p. 495). While repetition is lost, a quickened pace is gained in the target text, creating a sense of moving forward instead of continuously looking back.

In contrast, James adds more repetition than what was in the source text: "*Of intellectual **light, light** full of sheer / Pure **love, love** full of goodness true and right, / **Love** full of **joy, joy** so **sweet** as to shame / All other **sweet**…*" (p. 506). James repeats *light*, *full of*, *love*, *joy*, and *sweet*, repeating *love* three times. Lombardo, despite his macro choice of creating a word-for-word translation, still repeats *love* one more time than it is repeated in the source text: "*Light intellectual, full of **love**, / **love** of true good, **love** full of **joy**, / **joy** that transcends every kind of sweetness*" (p. 295). This increased repetition strengthens the connection between the lines, which helps to compensate for the loss of terza rima. Gray's translation, losing the parallelism, repetition, and terza rima in the source text, compensates by creating an internal rhyme with the elongated *i* vowel for sonic balance, "*with purest love and intellect: goodness / beautif**ie**d with absolute del**ight***" (p. 120).

James is the only translator not to end the group of lines with a full stop, which in the source text creates a slight pause, closing out the scene. Instead, he places the full stop halfway through the line: "*All other sweet things. Here you will know*" (p. 506). This strategy prevents his rhyming quatrains from sounding too bouncy or nursery rhyme-like.

Each translator renders the parallelism created by the repetition in the source text differently. Kirkpatrick recreates it, using sound effects such as alliteration to compensate for the lack of end rhyme. Raffel, instead of recreating the repetition, chooses to synonymise, while James and Lombardo introduce more repetition to create stronger interlinear connections. Gray, the only translator not to attempt to recreate the source text's parallelism, compensates for this loss with the use of internal rhyme. Each micro choice aims to adapt the source text to a suitable English language target text.

***

Locus 5 (ll. 82 – 86)

In the source text, rhyme can be observed in lines 82 and 84, *r**ua*** and *s**ua***, and lines 83 and 85, *sv**egli*** and *sp**egli***. In line 86, the repetition of vowels such *a*, *i* and *o* create sonic cohesiveness and density: ***a**ncor de l**i** occh**i**, ch**i**nd**a**nd**o**m**i** **a** l'**o**nd**a***.

Each translator applies different sound effects to recreate the poetic resonance of the source text. Kirkpatrick maintains unrhymed iambic pentameter throughout. His use of commas which naturally create slight pauses is more prolific than the source text. He also adds a full stop, generating a longer pause which sonically divides the two images presented. This pause combined with the alliteration of *m* adds emphasis to the images of consuming milk and eyes becoming mirrors: "*No baby, waking later from its nap / than it normally would, so hurled itself / face down to **m**other's **m**ilk as I did now. / To **m**ake **m**y eyes, as **m**irrors, better still, / I bent towards the wave that, flowing there*" (p. 465).

Raffel alternates between iambic pentameter for his translation of each of these lines, with the exception of line 83. This line bine being fewer poetic feet than the surrounding lines creates a rushing effect, doubling down on the meaning of the phrase as Dante performs a quick, almost desperate action: "*And suddenly plunges its face at its mother's*" (p. 496). Raffel creates a rhyme with the elongated *a* vowel in lines 82, 83, 86, and 87: "*No tiny child, sleeping past its time, w**a**kes / And suddenly plunges its f**a**ce / … There so we m**a**y be improved, desperate / To m**a**ke my eyes a better source of mirrors*" (p. 496). He also incorporates alliteration of *m*: "***m**ilk, **m**oves" and "**m**ake **m**y*" (496). Despite the loss of perfect terza rima, Kirkpatrick and Raffel unite meaning and sound just as Dante did in his original through alternative poetic effects.

Lombardo's translation, like the source text, relies heavily on enjambment. The fluidity of Lombardo's translation is furthered by the near-rhyme of the elongated *i* vowel: "*Never has an infant, waking up later / than its usual t**i**me to nurse, turned its face / with such alacrity toward its milk / As **I** turned m**i**ne then, making m**y** **eye**s / into better mirrors by leaning down / toward the water that flows to make us better*" (p. 299). Alliteration of the *m* consonant also adds to this onward flow, particularly in the last two lines: ***m**ilk*, ***m**ine*, ***m**aking **m**y*, ***m**irrors*, and ***m**ake*. Lombardo's close attention to the word order runs the risk of his translation sounding clunky in English. However, his application of sound devices creates a pleasant verse that is enjoyable and pulls the reader along.

Both James and Gray maintain iambic pentameter throughout. They also both employ end rhyme. James ties lines 104, 106 and 108 together with the repetition of the elongated *o* vowel: "*No infant that has slept too long could thr**o**w / Itself s**o** suddenly, its sure aim set, / Towards the milk, as I, who thirsted s**o** / To make of my eyes better mirrors still, / Bent down to where I saw the waters fl**o**w*". This break in James' regular rhyme scheme serves to draw particular attention to these lines, highlighting their significance. This is indeed a turning point in Dante's journey through *Paradiso* as he prepares to see the courts of heaven clearly for the first time. Further drawing attention to the significance of this moment is James' use of sibilance: "*it**s**elf **s**o **s**uddenly, it**s** **s**ure aim **s**et*" (p. 508).

In Gray's translation, internal and end rhyme can be observed. Consider the elongated *a* vowel and the shortened *e* vowel: "*No b**a**by w**a**king hungry, having sl**e**pt / more than it should, sucks at my mother's br**ea**st / b**e**side the stream that would improve my eyes*" (Gray, 2020: 121). Like James, Gray maintains a consistent iambic pentameter throughout. In the context of Gray's full colloquial translation, which previously lacked a consistent rhythm, employing iambic pentameter for this moment conveys the enormous prestige and importance of the scene.

In the translations of lines 82 to 86, various sound effects can be observed, all of which are applied to achieve emphasis and heightened meaning. Kirkpatrick maintains

unrhymed iambic pentameter and varies his use of alliteration and pause to draw attention to certain images. Raffel manipulates rhythm, rhyme and alliteration to compensate for the loss of perfect terza rima. Lombardo uses enjambment, near-rhyme and alliteration to sonically smooth out his close, almost word-for-word translation. Both James and Gray use end rhyme to evoke the impact of the terza rima in the source text. All translators succeed in applying micro choices that adhere to their initial macro choices overall.

***

In the various translations of Dante's *Paradiso* 30, translators grapple with replicating the intricate sound effects of the source text. Kirkpatrick employs iambic pentameter, leaning toward internal rhyme, assonance, alliteration and pause to echo the source text's aural density as per his macro choice. Raffel's macro choice to highlight the poem's lyrical flow informs his micro choices to introduce variations of iambic pentameter and different forms of rhyme. Lombardo, in paying close attention to the rhythm, compensates for the lack of rhymes in his translation. James' heavy enjambment, as well as the regular use of end rhyme, recreates the source text's forward drive, with pause being utilised to add emphasis to certain phrases. Gray's micro choices fulfill his macro choice to create a translation in 'prosaic verse', alternating between near-rhyme, perfect rhyme and more subtle sound effects such as sibilance. The vast majority of translators' micro choices align with their macro choices. Cases where micro and macro choices do not align demonstrate the necessity of nuance and flexibility when approaching complex poetic works, and how the most optimal micro choice in service of the quality of the translation as a whole might differ from the translators' initial creative vision or macro choice.

This study aimed to address the gap in Dante studies and translations studies by analysing how terza rima has been rendered by contemporary English translators. Overall, the analysis of sound in these translations highlights how every translator makes both micro and macro choices to adapt the original text's poetic elements into the target language. While there are inevitable losses due to linguistic differences, compensations are made through various sound effects, such as alliteration, internal rhyme, and sibilance. By repeating certain sounds, translators are able to create a musical quality, draw attention to specific words and phrases, and contribute to a sense of fluidity by drawing subtle connections between certain words. The complexity of recreating the musicality and poetic essence of Dante's work in English has produced unique and diverse renditions that reflect the individual styles of the translators.

REFERENCES

Works by Dante Alighieri

Dante A. (1966-1967), *La Divina Commedia*, edited by Petrocchi G., Mondadori, Milano.
Dante A., *Commedia*, Princeton Dante Project: https://dante.princeton.edu/pdp/

Translations of *La Divina Commedia*

Gray A. (2019) *HELL Dante's Divine Trilogy Part One. Decorated and Englished in Prosaic Verse.* Canongate Books, Edinburgh.
Gray A. (2020), *PARADISE Dante's Divine Trilogy Part Three. Englished in Prosaic Verse* Books, Edinburgh.

Clive J. (2013), *The Divine Comedy*, Picador, London.
Kirkpatrick R. (2012), *The Divine Comedy*, Penguin Classics, London.
Lombardo S.(2017), *Paradiso*, Hackett Publishing, Indianapolis (IN-USA).
Raffel B. (2010), *The Divine Comedy*, Northwestern University Press, Evanston (IL-USA) .

Secondary Sources

Blakesley J. (2021), "Translating the Classics", in Rundle C. (ed.), *The Routledge Handbook of Translation History*, Routledge, London, pp. 372-388.
Cavagnoli F. (2003) "Vola Gigino?: Translating David Malouf's Novels into Italian", in *Southerly*, 63, 1, pp. 73-78.
Dukes H. (2021) "700 Years of Dante's Divine Comedy in Art.", in *The Public Domain Review*, 14 Sept. 2021: https://publicdomainreview.org/collection/dante-divine-comedy-in-art/.
Goethe J. W. von, Eckermann J. P., Oxenford J., Soret F. J. (1883), *Conversations of Goethe with Eckermann and Soret*, Translated from the German by John Oxenford, George Bell & Sons, London.
Kleinhenz C. (2013), "Reading and Seeing Dante's Divine Comedy: Verbal and Visual Translation", in Kinder J., Glenn D. (eds.), *Legato Con Amore in Un Volume: Essays in Honour of John A. Scott*, Olschki, Firenze, pp. 285-308.
Longenbach J. (2007), "Out of the Fire", in *New York Times Book Review*, 7, p. 52.
Scott J. (1997), "Paradiso XXX", in Nolan D. (ed.), *Dante Commentaries, Eight Studies of the Divine Comedy*, Irish Academic Press, Dublin.
Scott J. (2004), *Understanding Dante*, University of Notre Dame Press, Notre Dame (IN-USA).
Venuti L. (2013), *Translation Changes Everything: Theory and Practice*, Taylor and Francis Group, Abingdon (UK).
Verdicchio M. (2010), "Empyrean: Theology (XXX−XXXIII)", in ID, *The Poetics of Dante's Paradiso*, University of Toronto Press, Toronto, pp. 161-169.

Appendix A. Translatants into English

Below is each of the exact translations of the selected loci as presented in each edition of *Paradiso.*

		Target Texts				
Locus	**Source Text**	**Kirkpatrick**	**Raffel**	**James**	**Lombardo**	**Gray**
Locus 1 (ll. 1 – 3)	*Forse semilia miglia di lontano / ci ferve l'ora sesta, e questo mondo / china già l'ombra quasi al letto piano*	Maybe, around six thousand miles away, / the sixth hour, close to noon, flares out, while earth / inclines its shadow-cone to rest, near level.	Perhaps six thousand miles away, the sixth / Hour is glowing, and in this world of ours / The shadow's sloping down to the far horizon,	Six thousand long miles eastward it is noon. / Here, night is ending. The Earth's shadow lies / Level in bed, and in the mid-sky, soon,	Some six thousand miles away the noon hour / perhaps burns bright, and already our world here / inclines its shadow almost to a level bed,	The sun behind the world's vast curvature / cast its steep cone of shadow to the height / where constellations gleamed throughout the night / until a faint dawn, shining in the east / increased, tilted the shadow to the west.
Locus 2 (ll. 14 – 15)	*per che tornar con li occhi a Bëatrice / nulla vedere e amor mi costrinse.*	And so, from seeing nothing - and in love - / I turned my eyes towards Beatrice.	So there was nothing to see, and love obliged me / To turn and see my Beatrice, forever bright.	Retreated from my sight, so, being blind / And full of love, there was no help for it:	so that my seeing nothing and my love / constrained my eyes to turn back to Beatrice.	so dazzling that, apart from Beatrice, / I could not see a thing. If all I've said

Appendix A (continued).

		Target Texts				
Locus	**Source Text**	**Kirkpatrick**	**Raffel**	**James**	**Lombardo**	**Gray**
Locus 3 (ll. 28 – 29)	*Dal primo giorno ch'i' vidi il suo viso / in questa vita, infino a questa vista*	Not since the day that I, in our first life, / first saw her face until this living sight,	In this life, and on the day I saw her / Face the very first time, and until today,	The time from that first day I came to see / Her face in life to this incredible / Moment of seeing her again, my song	From the first day that I saw her face / in this life, until this vision of her now,	From the first day I saw her as a child / her beauty made my verses beautiful.
Locus 4 (ll. 40 – 42)	*luce intelletüal, piena d'amore; / amor di vero ben, pien di letizia; / letizia che trascender ogne dolzore*	to light, pure light of intellect, all love, / the love of good in truth, all happiness, / a happiness transcending every rapture.	In the heavens, a thinking brightness, full of love - / The love of truthful goodness, filled with a joy / Transcending any and every kind of sweetness.	Of intellectual light, light full of sheer / Pure love, love full of goodness true and right, / Love full of joy, joy so sweet as to shame	Light intellectual, full of love, / love of true good, love full of joy, / joy that transcends every kind of sweetness.	with purest love and intellect: goodness / beatified with absolute delight.
Locus 5 (ll. 82 – 86)	*Non è fantin che sì sùbito rua / col volto verso il latte, se si svegli / molto tardato da l'usanza sua / come fec' io, per far migliori spegli / ancor de li occhi, chindandomi a l'onda*	No baby, waking later from its nap / than normally it would, so hurled itself / face down to mother's milk as I did now. / To make my eyes, as mirrors, better still, / I bent towards the wave that, flowing there,	No tiny child, sleeping past its time, wakes / And suddenly plunges its face at its mother's / Breast, starving for milk, moves any faster / Than I, bending down to that river, flowing / There so we may be improved, desperate / To make my eyes a source of better mirrors	No infant that has slept too long could throw / Itself so suddenly, its sure aim set, / Towards the milk, as I, who thirsted so / To make of my eyes better mirrors still, / Bent down to where I saw the waters flow,	Never has an infant, waking up later / than its usual time to nurse, turned its face / with such alacrity toward its milk / As I turned mine then, making my eyes / into better mirrors by leaning down / toward the water that flows to make us better;	No baby waking hungry, having slept / more than it should, sucks at a mother's breast / more eagerly than I flung myself down / beside the stream that would improve my eyes.